



BRITISH ARCHAEOLOGICAL ASSOCIATION

Valladolid Conference Abstracts

ROMANESQUE AND THE MONASTIC ENVIRONMENT

8–10 APRIL 2024

MONDAY 8 APRIL

Eduardo Carrero

What is a Benedictine Monastery? Reflections on the Cloistered Topography of an Architecture with a Potential for Identity

Was the character of Benedictine monasteries reflected in the aesthetic opposition promulgated by Bernard of Clairvaux in his famous letter to Guillaume de Saint-Thierry? In this paper I will attempt to establish the contradictions inherent in this approach. Above all I will focus on the architecture, discussing the possibility of a distinctive Benedictine monastic topography as opposed to the more functional approach found in Cistercian monasteries.

Peter Scott Brown

The Abbey of Saint-Sever and the Architecture of Resistance to Monastic and Religious Reform

The abbey of Saint-Sever in Gascony, rebuilt beginning c. 1065, is a site of great importance for the history of Romanesque art. The extraordinary abbey church, with seven apses constructed in echelon, is closely comparable in plan to Cluny II, as previous scholars have observed, without seriously investigating the implications of this relationship. The abbey's Beatus manuscript, also produced c. 1065, is one of the most celebrated artworks of the eleventh century, yet apart from a brief article by Otto Werckmeister, it remains almost unexamined as a source of potential insight into the architectural concept and function of the abbey church. The work of Saint-Sever's most important student, Jean Cabanot, though invaluable, has left many questions unanswered, as the author himself acknowledged. Cabanot's passing in 2021 calls for an appreciation of his insights into monastic life and architecture at Saint-Sever and for revisiting questions about the abbey's contribution to monastic art and culture in southwestern France.

In this study, I will consider closely the design and function of the abbey's north transept portal and tribune, which are among the church's most unusual and innovative features. The portal preserves a sculpted tympanum, one of the earliest extant, whose design and apocalyptic iconography betray its relationship to the abbey's Beatus. Crossing the threshold, one enters a species of loggia, separated from the transept by an arcade and terminating in the northern-most apse. The loggia supports a free-standing arcade of four arches that defines a second-story tribune which also terminates in a small chapel. The functions of this unusual space and its counterpart on the south extreme of the transept have been the subject of speculation by Cabanot and others. To date, scholars have ignored the fact that the Saint-Sever beatus contains the representation of a church that corresponds almost precisely to this design—the image of John measuring the temple on fol. 150v—an image that moreover attributes specific functions and purposes to these lateral aisles and tribunes. These architectural and pictorial cousins, conceived and produced at the same moment in time, reflect concepts of the division of ecclesial space whose purpose is exclusion and judgment. In the Beatus miniature, the north aisle corresponding to the north transept loggia at Saint-Sever is described by an inscription and the *Commentary* as 'an empty space within the walls' that 'seems to be a part of the Temple yet is nevertheless not the Temple.' According to Beatus, this space is for those who seem to be part of the Church but do not worship the Lord and are thus to be cast out of the Church. As this image suggests—and as the apocalyptic iconography of the north portal tympanum confirms—the public-facing north transept portal and loggia played a critical role in defining access to (and exclusion from) the church at Saint-Sever. More to the point, I will argue, they frame a judicial setting of judgement, anathema, and perhaps treaty and reconciliation, a space in which the abbot, Gregory of Montaner, and his successors, who styled themselves as the princely temporal and apostolic heirs of their patron saint, Severus Rex, presided as judges over the temporal affairs of the abbey and the Church in Gascony. The north transept portal and loggia and the Beatus manuscript itself, I will show, were conceived as ornamental seats of the abbots' independent canonical authority in opposition to papal and other 'foreign' agents, who sought to reshape the region in the later eleventh century in the name of religious and canonical reform.

Cecily Hennessy

Secular Canonesses and the Recreation of the Holy Sepulchre at Gernrode

This paper addresses the creation and function of a Holy Sepulchre chapel within the liturgical space of the abbey at Gernrode. It explores the design and decoration of the chapel in a monastery dedicated to secular canonesses and overseen by aristocratic abbesses. Unlike other early examples of buildings representing in some sense the circular plan of the rotunda and aedicule of the Anastasis in Jerusalem, at Gernrode the chapel takes the form of two square chambers, referencing the fore chamber of the angel and the inner tomb chamber. These are set in the southeast of the nave and could be integrated into the liturgical space of the abbey. Originally the two chambers were accessed from the southeast bay of the abbey and later through a door into the nave. The symbolism of the Anastasis is strikingly clear through the sculpture both on the exterior walls and in the interior space of the chapel. The sculpture is dated perhaps as early as 1090. On the exterior walls, on permanent view to the canonesses, the sculpture focuses in three sets of sculpture on the role of Mary Magdalene as a companion of Christ, as the first witness of his Resurrection, and as an apostle to the apostles, surely subjects chosen to evoke the significance of the Magdalene in the Gospel narratives. The surviving interior sculpture depicts an angel, two of the three Maries at the Tomb and a man often referred to as a bishop.

Key questions are to what extent was the interior space of the chambers preserved for the male ecclesiastics or could women enter it and to what extent was its use limited to Passion Week? Evidence of its liturgical use in the early 16th-century may throw light on earlier practice.

Clearly, for the canonesses the site in Jerusalem dedicated to the burial and resurrection of Christ, the holiest place in Christendom, was important. Although many women did make pilgrimages to the Holy Land, their opportunities for doing so were limited, and crusading was pre-eminently a male prerogative. Jerusalem was brought here within the canonesses' own sanctuary. It was decorated for their viewing, at least in part throughout the year, with an emphasis, not on the crucifixion, deposition and burial of Christ, but on the crucial role played by women in witnessing his resurrection.

Verónica Abenza

The Broader Space of the Enclosure and the Creation of Female Monastic Identities in North-Eastern Iberia

During the 11th and 12th centuries, the Iberian lands just south of the Pyrenees joined in the pan-European phenomenon of the reformation of female monastic houses. This translated into the building of a representative, albeit rather modest, number of female monastic compounds. Before the expansion of the Cistercian order, these new communities did not respond to a multiplicity of religious observances and were organized following a still undefined model of female Benedictine spirituality. Yet, each monastery was significant to the extent that there was only one in each of the different territorial units that constituted the Catalan counties and nascent kingdom of Aragón. Most were born in response to the increasing number of religious vocations among aristocratic women, thus becoming familial monasteries and corresponding to a milieu where only the royal and comital elites enjoyed the privilege of founding new houses. In consequence, there has been a tendency among art historians to investigate the architecture of the Catalan and Aragonese monasteries in terms of the patronage of their elite founders, or by assessing them against their male counterparts. These avenues of enquiry haven't led to a better understanding of the use and symbolic meaning of female monastic spaces, however. Since the 1980s, research into the relationship between gender and monastic space has become well established. Following in the footsteps of Jane Tibbetts Schulenburg, Jeffrey Hamburger, Meredith Parsons Lillich, and Therese Martin, more recent scholarship (spearheaded by historians such as Anne Müller) has been looking at the importance of the claustral environment for identity-building.

Such academic awareness has now reached female medieval monasteries in Iberia. The current scholarly situation is uneven and most contributions deal with the western part of the peninsula and individual religious orders, with a range of studies that focus on the late Middle Ages while marginalizing the north-eastern female context. This paper seeks to redress this. From the early Benedictine nunneries (Sant Daniel de Girona, Sant Pere del Burgal, Santa María de Santa Cruz de la Serós) to the later Cistercian and Hospitaller convents of Vallbona and Sigena, the development and organisation of female space was dictated by the *cura monialum*, the interaction with male authorities, and the sociocultural conditions of the communities. My paper concerns a period when normative settings and organizational structures were still being established in these lands, and thus a context in which the arrangement of liturgical, devotional, or instrumental spaces was still ambiguously shared between church and cloister. I hope to offer new insights into the architecture of female houses, where the performance of paraliturgical rites by the nuns, the need for contact with the outside world, funerary requirements, and patronal interference acted on monastic planning. In doing so, the paper addresses the issue of how diverse plans, elevations and forms of

architectural decoration provided new possibilities for the representation of distinctive female monastic identities within the broader space of the enclosure.

Rose Walker

Refreshing reform in Benedictine monastic precincts of mid-12th century León-Castile

In the later 11th century the great Benedictine monasteries of León-Castile (SS Facundo and Primitivo, Sahagún; San Pedro de Cardeña, San Salvador de Oña, San Pedro de Arlanza; Santo Domingo de Silos) had been intimately involved in reform of the Iberian church. Even those who initially resisted, perhaps San Millán de la Cogolla in La Rioja, eventually re-invented their monastic houses in an orthodox guise. As part of this process, Cluny acquired some priories, notably the recent foundation of Santa María at Nájera, and the new foundation of San Zoilo at Carrión de los Condes. By the middle decades of the 12th century, new waves of reform were emanating from the papacy and from Cluny. The role of the Iberian Benedictine houses as champions of reform was threatened by the arrival of Cistercians, Military Orders and Regular Canons, who began to attract a significant portion of the available royal and aristocratic donations. How did these established institutions respond to the new challenges? What visual strategies did they use to assert their identities and, in particular, how did they integrate their pasts into a vibrant and rigorous image of reformed monasticism?

This paper will address these questions primarily through a consideration of sculptural interventions made in monastic precincts constructed at some, but not all, of these Iberian monasteries in the mid-12th century; the churches appear to have received comparatively little rebuilding or refurbishment. Many of the cloister buildings have been lost, and what may seem the obvious case study, Santo Domingo de Silos, remains the subject of a dating controversy. Instead, this paper will begin by analysing the fragmentary elements that survive at the ancient Castilian monasteries of San Salvador de Oña and San Pedro de Cardeña, as they can be dated fairly securely. Oña was not a priory of Cluny, but it did falsify a charter that asserted a century of Cluniac customs, while, by contrast, Cardeña had a brief and controversial existence as a priory after being donated to Cluny. The surviving sculpture in these monasteries is non-figural: a richly-carved blind arcade from the refectory at Oña, and at Cardeña a cloister arcade on single columns. In both cases, the vegetal and geometric repertoire has been linked convincingly to work at Cluny, including its screen and cloister, and at Paray-le-Monial. Yet some features were adapted, perhaps in response to more local and historical points of reference. The possible significance of this will be considered in a somewhat wider sculptural context, and with reference to wall painting and manuscripts. The relationship between embellishment and the topography of the precincts will also be addressed, and whether it is possible to draw any conclusions about the nature of processions in these institutions.

Javier Martínez de Aguirre

Identity and Artistic Ambition in the Benedictine Priors of the Iberian Peninsula

Art-historical literature has traditionally focused on the Benedictine abbeys that, along with cathedrals, were the protagonists of the development of great European Romanesque art and architecture. In recent years, the importance of Benedictine spirituality in cathedrals built by Benedictine bishops has also been explored. However, the relevance of the artistic production of Benedictine priories has not yet been systematically addressed. Of lesser dimensions and quality compared to abbeys, priories could stand out in their respective geographical areas, some of them being widely known internationally, such as Santa

María de Iguácel (Huesca, Spain), a priory of San Juan de la Peña that was the object of A. Kingsley Porter's research.

On occasion, priories preserve high-quality Romanesque works, which we assume are similar to those that must have existed in abbeys and that have not survived. In Spain, this is the case of the church of Bagüés (Zaragoza), also a priory of San Juan de la Peña, whose mural paintings are comparable, in this sense, with how the murals of the priory of Berzé-la-Ville might relate to Cluny. Similarly, some priories bear witness to longer distance artistic relationships, such as those linking the capitals of San Jorge de Azuelo (Navarra), a Cluniac priory of Santa María de Nájera, with respect to San Pedro de las Dueñas (León), a female abbey dependent on Sahagun.

Priories, in addition, could have been decisive for the implantation of Romanesque art in certain regions, or they manifest a particular architectonic and artistic ambition, as well as a diversity worthy of attention, as evidenced by the cases of San Pedro el Viejo de Huesca, Santiago de Ruesta (Zaragoza), Santervás de Campos (Valladolid), Nogal de las Huertas (Palencia), San Pere el Gros de Cervera (Lérida), San Frutos de Duratón (Segovia) or Santa María de Yarte (Navarra).

Faced with such a broad panorama, this presentation will focus on two aspects: on the one hand, to what extent the architecture and figurative arts of Iberian Romanesque priories resorted to artistic forms and themes to manifest links with the abbeys to which they belonged; and, on the other hand, in what sense the Romanesque art of priories shows a higher level of ambition and resources compared to the artistic production of their closest environment.

Juan Antonio Olañeta

Aragonese 'Dissecta Membra': Recomposing Scattered Cloister Ensembles

In 2020 and 2021, the provenance of two capitals that are currently in North American collections, more precisely at the Art Institute of Chicago and at the Glencairn Museum, was determined. Both came from the missing Romanesque cloister of the Jaca cathedral. The affiliation was confirmed after a stylistic and iconographic study, as well as by applying an instrumental neutron activation analysis (INAA) – the latter conducted by the Limestone Sculpture Provenance Project. In this paper, I will present a study of the structure and iconography of the cloister based on the currently known *dissecta membra* and the documentary evidence that has survived. The pieces from this cloister show some stylistic affinities with an unpublished capital preserved in the collection of the Museu de Maricel in Sitges. This capital includes representations of the Annunciation to the Virgin, the Nativity and the Annunciation to the Shepherds. These themes appear, with a practically identical composition, in a capital from the cloister of Jaca, conserved in a private collection in the same locality. Given that it is unlikely that both capitals are from a single cloister, one piece may be from another cloister closely linked to Jaca, a cloister that does not survive today, that of Santa María de Santa Cruz de la Serós. Study of surviving material from the cloister of Santa Cruz de la Serós, in addition to this new capital, will allow us to make proposals about the latter monastery.

TUESDAY 9 APRIL

Neil Stratford

The monastery at Cluny in the Romanesque period

A rapid survey of what is known about the monastery at Cluny in the 11th and 12th centuries: the 4 churches within the walls, tombs and burial, the choir screen and choir furnishings, the cloister, the layout of the buildings, the refectory, the Lady Chapel and its role related to burials and the chapter house, a Cluniac speciality.

Wilfried Keil

Figurative Architectural Sculpture in Cloisters as a Schoolbook in the 11th and 12th Centuries

We know from written sources that cloisters in the Middle Ages were not only used for circulation and as places for contemplation or reading, but for ablutions or for teaching novices as well. The question is whether cloisters were designed accordingly for the latter purpose. Might the capitals of the individual wings have been designed to reflect different functions?

For the cloister of SS. Pietro ed Orso in Aosta, a former Augustinian priory, I was able to ascertain that some of the capitals in the south walk were used for teaching novices (Schrift und Bild zur Bildung? Die Kapitelle im Kreuzgang von SS. Pietro ed Orso in Aosta, in Frese, Tobias; Keil, Wilfried E. and Kristina Krüger (eds.), Sacred Scripture / Sacred Space – The Interlacing or Real Places and Conceptual Spaces in Medieval Art and Architecture (Berlin, Boston 2019). The basis for this can be found in the *consuetudines*, rules and statutes that were created at the beginning of the 12th century, in which the duties and tasks of the canons were recorded in writing. From the *consuetudines* of the Augustinian canons in Rolduc (Klosterrath) we know that there were areas in the cloister in which Psalms were sung during the washing of feet or where the novices sat and received lessons. The instruction took place not only with books and stories, but the figurative scenes and inscriptions of the capitals in the cloister also served for teaching. The stories can be vividly explained on capitals. Many medieval authors such as Theophilus Presbyter, Honorius Augustodunensis, or Sicardus of Cremona have described the instructive function of images. The fact that images not only served to instruct is made clear by Sicardus of Cremona, who saw the actual purpose of images in the way they served memory. In the south walk of the cloister in Aosta there is a series of capitals with prophets and scrolls. The inscriptions on the scrolls quote verses or parts of verses that refer to important actions or sayings of the respective prophet. This arrangement corresponds to a classification system. The inscriptions will have reminded the novices and canons of the corresponding text passages of the prophets. On the basis of the prophet capitals, it can be assumed that the mnemonic technique, known from antiquity, was used and taught. An inscription with an excerpt of a Bible verse recalls the entire Bible passage and the following inscriptions do the same, so that the entire course of a story is brought to mind. The *loci*-method was used for this.

There are also figurative capitals or reliefs with or without pictorial inscriptions in other cloister walks at Aosta and in other cloisters that suggest a mnemonic function. Did these also serve to teach the novices? What about the different orders? And why are there also episcopal churches with capitals in the cloister that suggest a mnemonic function? To whom were these capitals addressed? With many capitals or reliefs in cloisters,

multi-functionality can be assumed. Apart from the order and its rules, local tradition, the liturgy and clerical circulatory routes are also decisive. The latter are in turn determined by the arrangement of adjacent rooms.

Based on the example of Aosta, the talk will show that there were most probably other cloisters whose capitals and reliefs suggest a mnemonic function that could have served to teach novices. Examples for which a mnemonic function is very likely and for which the different problematics can be discussed are the cloister of Moissac (Benedictine), the Daurade in Toulouse (Benedictine), Santo Domingo de Silos (Benedictine), and the cathedral of Monreale (Benedictine). The cloisters of Saint-Trophime in Arles (cathedral), Saint-Trophime in Eschau (Benedictine nunnery) and the cathedral of Girona (Augustinian) may also be further examples

Julia Perratore

'Locus Amoenus': The Romanesque Cloister and Garden

The Met Cloisters is known above all for two things: its installations of portions of five different medieval cloisters, from which the museum takes its name, and its gardens, which have formed part of the museum since it first opened in 1938. The installation of cloister elements from Saint-Michel de Cuxa, placed at the heart of the museum and surrounding a lush 'pleasure garden' of different sights and scents, has become for many visitors the medieval cloister *par excellence*, despite the cloister's reduced dimensions in comparison to the original, and despite the many liberties taken in the garden's plantings, which include many new world species. In her book, *The Lithic Garden: Nature and the Transformation of the Medieval Church* (2018), Mailan Doquang reflected on the vegetal carvings in another of the Met's cloisters, the late Romanesque Saint-Guilhem-le-Désert, writing that 'the diversity of these elegant sculptures echoes in general terms the vegetation that once grew within the garth, which itself reflected the *varietas* of God's Creation'.

This comment reveals two widespread assumptions: one, that monastic cloisters were planted, and two, that the foliate decorations of the space's monumental sculptures rhyme with the living vegetation of the garth. What of the actual Romanesque cloister garden? To what extent can we insist on the presence of a garden in the first place? If we can insist, how can we imagine the presence of an actual garden to have interacted with vegetal carvings, especially when information on what was planted in a specific garden, at a specific moment, remains elusive? If we take as a given the idea of the monastic cloister as a *locus amoenus*, a Paradise garden—or, alternatively, as a reprisal of the earthly Eden designed to prepare monks for Paradise after death—how might these associations have manifested themselves in the sculpture? Moreover, how does the concept of cloister as Paradise garden play out amid the comparatively limited formal vocabulary of Romanesque vegetal ornament, which typically privileges acanthus leaves, palmettes, rosettes, and stem-like volutes? Did these plants have any true referent in nature for medieval viewers? In particular, what significances might the near-ubiquitous acanthus leaf have borne for viewers, apart from its general indications of health and fecundity on the one hand, and its classical references on the other?

In this paper, I propose to explore these questions with a specific group of Romanesque cloisters in mind: those of Saint-Guilhem-le-Désert, its decontextualized sculptures divided between Saint-Guilhem, Montpellier, and New York; Saint-Trophime at Arles; and Aix-en-Provence. With their concentrations of exuberant vegetal carvings, these monuments provide a useful point of departure to explore relationships between carved arcade and planted garth. In search of answers, I will combine close examination of the sculptures themselves with the study of a body of texts relating to the founding of Saint-Guilhem-le-Désert and other, contemporary monastic institutions, paying particular attention to the importance placed on the act of cultivation in monastic foundation, daily life, and identity.

John McNeill

The Cloister and the Column

The column seems to have been the support *par excellence* for cloister arcades during the Romanesque period, used, even where vaults were employed, albeit often in conjunction with piers. The capacity of columns to minimise light loss between the cloister garden and the walk in an area where reading was important may have been a practical commendation, as was the column's role as an unobtrusive seat divider. Columns were also important in creating a visual and spatial link with the chapterhouse, while, once established as a preferred form of support, its lightweight and skeletal qualities were exploited aesthetically over the 12th century, and led to the creation of a type of claustral microarchitecture.

But were there other reasons for the adoption of columns, rooted in Roman precedent and related to garden and courtyard design? Of all the possible design sources for the medieval cloister that have been proposed and rejected, the garden courtyard brings together seating, lighting, and enclosure with permeable access to rooms around its edges. The 'facility' of Roman courtyard plans was dependent on the column and, in combination with stylobates, was perhaps fundamental to the creation of monastic cloisters.

Dustin Aaron

Conrad of Salzburg's Augustinians and Sculpted Wilderness in the Alps

A scene of monks chopping down trees to establish a grange calls to mind the Cistercians, who fastidiously crafted their public image as pioneers of Europe's wild places. But Christian monasticism generally is built on the idea of supplanting the hermetic wilderness (the biblical *deserta*) with productive settlement, and other orders were just as quick to conflate their spiritual endeavors with those to develop *curiae*, or farms, on their monastery's land.

One surprisingly rapacious group were the Augustinians, a publicly ministering order of canons—especially those houses founded by Archbishop Conrad I of Salzburg after the year 1106. The churches and cloisters he helped establish are seldom decorated with the kinds of biblical stories, eschatological scenes, or monsters that make up the canonical repertoire of Romanesque sculpture. The Augustinian monasteries in the Alps focus instead almost exclusively on motifs associated with wilderness: lions, sirens, dragons, and other creatures located by the bestiary tradition in the *silva* at the fringes of society. As a ministering order, Augustinians could only establish themselves in places with preexisting populations in need of ministering, not true wilderness. Resolving this incongruity became paramount when the monasteries of Berchtesgaden, Reichenhall, and Seckau found themselves engaged in fierce legal battles over the rights to the land they were clearing, farming, and mining around their monasteries. Their claims, made before the archbishop, rested on the perceived wildness of their property. This paper will argue that the seemingly wild sculpture decorating their cloisters served to ground their legal claims while supporting the canons' imaginative engagement with monastic desert ideals.

Angela Weyer

The Monastic Enclosures of Sankt Godehard at Hildesheim and Alpirsbach: Building Structures and Benedictine Consuetudines

This paper focuses on Benedictine monastic enclosures in medieval Germany, concentrating on the monasteries of Sankt Godehard in Hildesheim and Alpirsbach in the Black Forest, both of them subject building campaigns in the 12th and 15th centuries, in each case after joining the *Bursfelde* reform movement.

Two questions in particular will be addressed.

The 'ideal plan' of a Benedictine monastery is often taken as a basis for discussion, and despite its shortcomings it is a didactically useful if problematic model that does not take into account regionally and historically co-dependent developments in the treatment of monastic spaces. It is thus in danger of overemphasizing continuity in monastic architecture. The latter does exist, though only to a certain degree. The typological classification of a Romanesque fountain in the cloister of the monastery of Sankt Godehard as well as the classification of the late Gothic Lady Chapel and library in Alpirsbach are examples of how biased established room designations can be.

How is the very different observance of the *vita communis* demanded by Benedict, made concrete in the design of monastic spaces over time? The focus here will be on the dormitory and refectory, as well as the pre-Reformation pictorial program of an assembly hall in the monastery of Sankt Godehard, which has been documented in written sources.

Manuel Castiñeiras

New Insights into the Galilee at Sant Pere de Rodes: Monastic Space, Liturgical Performance and Narrative Imagery

The Galilee attached to the monastic church of the Benedictine abbey of Saint Pere de Rodes is best known for its no-longer-extant late Romanesque Portal, linking this liturgical and funerary space with the church. The luxurious doorway was for the most part assembled from a series of marble reliefs - some new, other reused - carved in the distinctive archaizing style of the so-called Master of Cabestany and his workshop.

The recent identification of new figurative reliefs and inscriptions have shed fresh light on the original configuration of the portal, affecting the way its meaning and audience should be understood (*Mestre de Cabestany. Espurnes de marbre* (Barcelona 2023)). This has spurred research into the date and liturgical function of the monastic galilee and its hitherto under-explored connection with other spaces and pictorial cycles within the monastic precinct.

Although the first explicit reference to this space as *galilea* dates from the 17th century, new documentary and archaeological evidence confirm its use as a galilee from the beginning of the 12th century, following well-known Cluniac customs. The performance of the Easter rites and the evocation of the Holy Land seem to have shaped both the inscriptions and the iconographic program of this image-laden space. Furthermore, the function of the galilee as a burial ground of the Counts of Empúries and a station for monastic processions

allows us to explore its links to the cloister and church, taking us deep into the aspirations and spirituality of this Benedictine community.

Nathalie Le Luel

Comital Power and Monastic Development in the 11th Century: Reflections on the Sculpted Decoration of the Abbey Church of Notre-Dame-de-la-Charité in Angers

Built during the 11th century, the abbey church of Notre-Dame-de-la-Charité in Angers, known as Notre-Dame du Ronceray since the 16th century, is still a little-known monument in the history of early Romanesque architecture and sculpture.

On the eve of a major restoration project, and at a time when a diagnosis of the interior painted decoration is underway, we have begun to investigate a hitherto neglected field, that of its sculpted figurative decoration. Taking into account the stylistic study published in 2003 by Maylis Baylé, in which she demonstrated the importance of this 11th-century construction site, the aim of this paper is to present the first results of a study of the iconography of the abbey church's capitals. Figurative capitals are in the minority compared with foliate designs, and are particularly concentrated in the crossing and eastern parts of the church. Although the programme is cut back to the south, this probably marks a liturgical threshold in the spatial organisation of the church and provides us with indications of the circulatory routes of the nuns, both within the sanctuary and to and from the monastic buildings. We will be paying close attention to the rhythm of the sculpted ensemble, and the layout of the figurative and narrative capitals, whose themes show a progression from west to east: from animal reliefs marking the entrance to the building, we gradually move on to sacred themes from the transept crossing (Flight into Egypt, saints, Fall, evangelists, etc).

The paper will also examine the choice of themes in relation to the local context (that of the comital foundation of a female monastery) and compare this 11th-century ensemble with contemporary sculpted decorations in other monasteries (Saint-Benoit-sur-Loire, Saint-Hilaire de Poitiers, as well as Saint-Denis and Saint-Germain-des-Prés in Paris) at a time when the first large-scale iconographic programmes were being created in monastic environments

WEDNESDAY 10 APRIL

Eric Cambridge

The Fortunes of Native English Saints in English Cathedral Priors following the Norman Conquest

The view that the continental clergy placed in charge of English churches in the generations after the Norman Conquest respected rather than denigrated the relics of the native English saints which they encountered is now widely accepted. Whether, and if so when, this extended to the former locations of their shrines after they were translated into the new Romanesque churches that were being built to house them is, however, less clear.

This paper will suggest that an initial phase in which such locations were not respected was quickly succeeded by one in which they were retained as secondary foci of their respective cults. Sometimes these relict features could be accommodated without undue difficulty, as at Winchester and Bury St Edmunds, but at Durham the position was more complicated. Here the key decisions which determined the subsequent layout of the Romanesque cathedral-priory must have been taken soon after the arrival of the monks in 1083; as a result the earlier cult site ended up within the new monastic cloister. At that stage the possibility that it would continue to be a cultic focus may not have been apparent; nevertheless, this appears to have been what happened following the translation of St Cuthbert's relics into the new cathedral in 1104. How the layout and design of the adjacent buildings was adapted to deal with the resulting conflict between a cultic focus attracting public attention situated within a space generally considered to have been the preserve of the monastic community will be examined.

The wider implications are that the restrictive view that native cults in Anglo-Norman England attracted little attention beyond the communities that served them requires modification; rather, some enjoyed a genuinely popular (albeit probably short-lived) phase in the early to mid twelfth century which had a significant impact on the layout of the monasteries that served them; in turn this poses questions about the extent to which the impact of external factors (here popular lay piety) might compromise the ostensibly autonomous agency of religious communities to determine the form and arrangement of their own buildings.

Richard Gem

The monastic choir: Lanfranc's Constitutions, Canterbury Cathedral and related English monastic churches

This paper proceeds from the premise that the divine office and mass were central not only to the formalities of the monastic life, but to the interiorisation by the monks of their religious identity. The celebration of this liturgy was performed by the choir of monks, singing in the designated choir space in the church, which was the spiritual heart of the monastery. The use of the word 'choir' should be restricted in reference to this chorus of monks and the physical space assigned to them.

Archbishop Lanfranc (1070-1089) arriving at Canterbury found there a Benedictine monastic community forming the chapter of the cathedral. He introduced a new customary for the use of this community; he also rebuilt entirely the cathedral church. The relationship between liturgical customs and architectural planning at Canterbury will be explored, insofar as this can be reconstructed on the basis of the surviving evidence.

Lanfranc also set up a new monastic community at Rochester Cathedral under Bishop Gundulph (1077-1087). The evidence for the liturgical planning will be examined, although it survives only in part; while the early-13th-century wooden choir stalls are among the earliest known.

A third building erected under Lanfranc's influence is the abbey church of St Albans, built under Abbot Paul (1077-1093). In this case the fabric of the building survives substantially complete. However, it differs from Canterbury and Rochester in that the church had to provide for the placement of a major shrine behind the high altar, that of St Alban.

All these three buildings saw the placement of the monastic choir in the crossing of the church and extending back into the east bays of the nave – a position traditional from at least the 9th century onwards. A radical change to this tradition was adopted at Canterbury Cathedral when Archbishop Anselm (1093-1109) decided to rebuild the presbytery arm of Lanfranc's church. Extending the building a considerable distance to the east, the monastic choir was now relocated entirely to the east of the crossing, leaving the crossing itself as merely a space of transition.

Alexandra Gajewski

The Crypt of the Convent at Jouarre: Its Date and Function

The convent of Jouarre (Seine-et-Marne) is most famous for its so-called crypt, now a freestanding building that contains the tombs of the founders' family, including those of the early abbesses. Until recently, the structure was thought to date from soon after the convent's foundation in c. 635 by the noble Ado, a member of the court of the Merovingian king Dagobert (d. 639).

In 2006, however, following excavations to the west of the crypt, the archaeologist Claude de Mecquenem presented evidence that the walls, windows, vaults and the position of the columns and tombs in the crypt all date to the early 12th century. He proposed that the tombs, some of which are Carolingian, were re-used, together with the late antique capitals and column shafts. Among the many questions that this radical re-interpretation raises, the liturgical function of the crypt, located to the north of the abbey church is perhaps the most important. Prior to De Mecquenem's redating, the crypt was thought to have been built to provide burial space for the founders' family and, by good fortune, to have survived the centuries. If, instead, the space was a creation of the 12th century, it indicates an interest in focusing on the founders and the convent's early abbesses by creating a liturgical centre dedicated to them. Although most of the convent's manuscripts and documents were lost in the Wars of Religion, some evidence can be gleaned from the surviving documentation, which hints at a major spiritual regeneration of the convent at this time. The paper uses the crypt at Jouarre to explore the wider, and much neglected question, of the position of early monastic foundations in the 12th century, faced with monastic reform and the new monastic orders.

Claude Andrault-Schmitt

Liturgical Spaces and their Uses in the 12th Century: Some Well-Documented Examples from the Limousin

Documentation on the functional use of spaces in French medieval monasteries is poor, and it is exceptional to be able to combine documentary and architectural/archaeological evidence. The following paper examines two exceptions to this

The Benedictine abbey of **Solignac**, founded in 638, is evidenced both by its architectural remains and by ancient plans, engravings and obituaries. Exceptionally, an illuminated Chapter Book of c. 1155 also survives.

This liturgical codex brings together all the readings necessary for the office of Prime as celebrated in the Chapter House, among which are the martyrology of Usuard and the rule of St. Benedict. These two texts are accompanied by obits recording the anniversaries to be celebrated each day, in which examples of nearby tombs serve as location markers. When examined in the light of the chapter book and early plans, the architecture of Solignac's monastic church (c. 1130-1150) is revealed as not very practical for liturgical circulation.

The monastic church of **L'Artige** – a recent foundation with austere pretensions consecrated in 1198 – was even less practical liturgically, given its very long and narrow nave. Nevertheless, we can see here how the designers accommodated the circulation of the brethren, particularly between the choir and the east walk of the cloister. L'Artige also raises the question of the general layout, which is entirely homogeneous, and based on terraces across several enclosures.

What Solignac and L'Artige have in common is that the spaces were essentially defined by the location of the dead, memory of place and the memory of the monks complementing each other. Another link between the two monasteries perhaps helps explain the parallelism: the designer of the installation and construction of L'Artige, Prior Hélié de l'Hort (1174-1202), was a former monk of Solignac.

Béla Zsolt Szakács

A Revolution in Cloister Building in East Central Europe

Building a regularly shaped cloister might have been evident in the Western monastic communities from the early Romanesque period. However, this is not the case in East Central Europe. The earliest identified monastic buildings that date from the 11th and 12th centuries were individual houses built close to the abbey church but separate from it (e.g. Pécsvárad, Feldebrő and Pásztó in Hungary). The early monasteries were also often built of wood (especially in Bohemia and Poland). A clear turning point in the history of cloister building occurs in the decades to either side of c.1200. The arrival of the Cistercian Order in the region is key to this, as with Wachock in Poland (founded in 1179) and Pilis in Hungary (founded in 1184). At the same time, Benedictine Abbeys were rebuilt following 'classically regular' patterns, as in Mogilno in Poland, the monastery of St George in Prague and a series of royal abbeys in Hungary (Pannonhalma, Somogyvár, Pécsvárad, Zalavár), followed by private monasteries (Szermonostor, Csoltmonostor).

The new architectural framework provided optimal forms for monastic reform, as urged by Pope Honorius III in 1225. The papal bull sent to the Hungarian prelates described the cloister in spiritual terms, connecting the east wing to justice, the south to temperance, the west to fortitude and the north to prudence. Interestingly, at this same time a new wave of cloister building activity can be detected in Rome (San Lorenzo, SS. Quattro Coronati, S. Paolo fuori le mura, Lateran Cathedral). This has been interpreted, at least in part, as a result of the reformist interests of Pope Innocent III. The paper proposed here will consider the impact of monastic reform rivalry, symbolic interpretation, and international relations on the 'revolution' in cloister building in East Central Europe.

Tomasz Węclawowicz

A Cistercian 'Paradise' near Kraków: The Abbey of Mogiła

The Cistercian Abbey in Mogiła, founded over 800 years ago, is still the largest monastic complex in Southern Poland. The Romanesque abbey church repeats the spatial pattern of Cîteaux II. Next to it, from the south, the Chapter House, refectories, dormitories and work-rooms were established round the cloister. Despite the tumultuous history of the region, the monumental church, the monastery complex, abbot's house and some of the outbuildings with the remains of the hospice walls have survived. Today the Abbey is surrounded by extensive landscaped grounds, which were once the grounds of the monastery grange.

The aim of this paper will be to consider the early stages of the Abbey complex based on varied source material. Reconstructions of the original layout, can be deduced from iconographic sources, which are, unfortunately, relatively late and dated from the end of the 16th and 18th century. The original liturgical function, and relations with the local parish, can be deduced from medieval written sources - references to changes to the interior of the church after fires and from certain papal, episcopal and ducal privileges for the monastery.

Barbara Franzé

The Romanesque Galleries of the Cloister at Saint-Trophime in Arles\|: Iconographic Disorder and Discursive Order

Since its rediscovery in the 19th century, the cloister of Saint-Trophime in Arles, south of the cathedral, has been the subject of numerous archaeological and iconographic studies. The relative chronology of the Arles construction site is the subject of unanimous research: construction efforts, initially dedicated to the cloister's north gallery, were then reserved for the cathedral's facade, followed by the cloister's east gallery. The south and west galleries belong to a later stage of construction, dating from the 14th century. With the exception of a few dissenting voices (Schneider 1983), critics also agree on the absolute chronology: citing the epitaph engraved on the northwest pillar of the cloister, art historians date the north gallery to the years 1180-1190, and the east gallery to the years 1200-1220. However, other clues - stylistic and historical - encourage us to re-examine the chronology: in my opinion, the work began as early as 1165, in the wake of the canonical reform.

Critics also question whether the two Romanesque galleries in the cloister were part of a pre-determined project that would give coherence to the decor. Pointing to the structural heterogeneity of the cloister's pillars, as well as the narrative ruptures and mix of Old Testament and New Testament themes, the critic denies that the original project was abandoned during construction, perhaps due to financial difficulties. In contrast, I will show the unified nature of the set. His analysis shows that the designer preferred the allegorical sense to the literal: the programmatic intention here takes precedence over the effort to achieve narrative coherence. Read in the light of exegesis, the episodes depicted render two ecclesiological "tableaux", i.e. stories of salvation involving the collectivity (= the Church) to the north, and individuals (= the Church's faithful) to the south. As represented here, the Church is both universal and singular (local), framed and ordered jointly by the two powers (religious and secular), and founded on faith, penance, renunciation and the sacraments. In the east gallery, the iconography is concerned with the salvation of the faithful: using biblical models, the image encourages secular rulers to govern with justice and mercy, and suggests that they make their salvation by taking part in holy wars.

The decoration of the Saint-Trophime cloister is therefore a social program, conceived by the cathedral's canons and primarily addressed to the laity, the faithful and parishioners of the Church. The choice of certain iconographic themes (mandatum, Visitatio Sepulchri, Ordo ad peregrinum), performed on the feasts of the liturgical calendar and described in the 14th-century Ordinary, attests to the accessibility of the cloister

space to the laity. In addition, spatial and discursive unity is achieved by moving around the cloister in processions.

Kirk Ambrose

Meaning and Community at Saint-Andoche, Saulieu: Notes on the Methods of Ilene Forsyth

Beginning in the 1970s, Ilene Forsyth wrote a series of pathbreaking articles that examined the relationship between Romanesque sculpture and monasticism. In addition to considering the religious significance of carved subjects such as the Apostolic Life, Balaam and the Ass, and the Rape of Ganymede, Forsyth likewise considered what emotional and social needs they addressed for monks. It is little known that for over forty years she was at work on a monograph on the Romanesque architecture and sculpture of Saint-Andoche, Saulieu; the manuscript was incomplete at the time of her death in 2022. This collegial church contains a rich variety of historiated capitals, with subjects ranging from cockfighting to a centaur. Forsyth believed these works addressed what she regarded to be a shared monastic and collegiate culture. Drawing on unpublished archival materials, this talk will contextualize and unpack Forsyth's methods and consider their implications for scholarship today.