



BRITISH ARCHAEOLOGICAL ASSOCIATION

Rome Conference Abstracts

IMAGE AND NARRATIVE IN ROMANESQUE ART

28-30 MARCH 2022

MONDAY 28 MARCH

Serena Romano

Image and Narrative in 'Romanesque' Rome: A Focus on San Crisogono

This paper concerns the wall paintings in the crypt of the Early Christian Church of San Crisogono, a structure which now forms part of the 'Lower Church', given how it was buried in the 1120s when Cardinal Giovanni da Crema built a new basilica above the earlier church. It is now difficult to perceive the space of the apse and of the crypt as they once would have been: the crypt is uncovered, and the remains of paintings are in very poor condition. The paintings themselves should be dated to the beginning of the second half of the eleventh century. They have always been understood as iconic figures of saints separated by fictive twisted columns, but they are instead a misunderstood example of visual communication of a very high degree of inventiveness and quality. This paper analyzes their relationship with the *Passio Sanctae Anastasiae* and proposes a 'narrative' reading, raising the question of what is visual narration; what it is for, who could have commissioned it, how is it positioned in the spaces for which it was intended, and to what other fields of culture and expressive systems is it connected, both in Rome and across a broader area, at the juncture between the Ottonian era and the beginning of the so-called Gregorian Reform.

Claudia Quattrocchi

Before Narrative: A multifocal method for mapping mural decoration in Central Italy

'A work of art before a work of art' is how Marilyn Aronberg Lavin defined the process of narrative planning with respect to mural painting (2014). Planning a narrative using images is itself a creative

act. But what does it mean to plan a pictorial narrative in the Middle Ages? What are the issues to be considered when approaching the pictorial cycles of the 11th and 12th centuries?

My paper is primarily methodological. Starting with a reflection on the word 'programme' and moving on to specific cases, my study proposes an integrated approach to the subject. We will consider a new method of interrogating decorative enterprises, in the light of the new critical methods of the last thirty years. To this end, a number of examples of paintings will be illustrated from the perspective of their arrangement. This sample is deliberately restricted to more or less well-known 11th and 12th century cycles in central Italy – all of which sit within a particular critical category - biblical cycles 'in imitation' of St. Peter's in Vatican. The 'iconographic programme' is the theme *par excellence*. Investigation of this phenomenon reveals the deliberate semantic multi-layering of church interiors. My aim is to construct a corollary of thematic nuclei that can help the viewer to uncover how decoration is programmed and then realised as a creative operation. The 'discomposition' and investigation of artistic programming therefore adopts a multifocal rather than a strictly linear perspective. Inevitably, the disciplines and approaches involved work within a cultural semiotic-anthropological paradigm.

First, I will focus on the relationships between architecture, space, liturgy, pathways and movement. Secondly, the methodology will address other themes: the relationship between copy and model; invention; the sensory perception of space in relation to liturgy; and the relationship between painting and other media both in the traditional and cross-media and performative sense.

Returning to the examples themselves, the final question concerns mapping in a scientific sense. It is interesting to investigate how statistical and serial analysis can be used on large numbers of examples, and how the idea of a database as an 'open work' could be updated.

Marcello Angheben

Polysemy and multifunctionality in the apsidal mosaics of San Clemente: Gregorian reform, liturgy and devotion

Since the studies of H el ene Toubert, Roman works from the end of the 11th and the first third of the 12th century have been interpreted as reflections of the Gregorian reform or contemporary political quarrels. This idea subsequently gained wide currency and was extended to works from northern Italy, France and Spain. In the last fifteen years, this approach has rightly begun to be questioned, as it is rarely based on historical arguments. This paper will apply this critical view to the San Clemente apsidal mosaics, which have often been considered as one of the most accomplished expressions of the Gregorian ideal.

The paper is divided into three parts. The first compares the mosaics at San Clemente with the two programmes for which a Gregorian reading can be established: the *Camera pro secretis consiliis* of Calixtus II and the Chapel of San Nicola of Anacletus II. In these programmes, however, an attempt must be made to distinguish between the expression of reform ideas and the personal ambitions of the commissioners. In the case of the chapel of San Nicola, a distinction must also be made between the political components and those that refer to the primary functions of the chapel, namely liturgy and devotion. The latter focuses on a replica of the icon of Santa Maria in Trastevere, the *Madonna della Clemenza*, to which Calixtus II and Anacletus, two former cardinals of this *titulus*, were deeply attached.

Insofar as the political interpretation of these programmes presents no difficulty, they constitute a solid point of reference, even if they were seen in the private setting of the Lateran Palace. They therefore allow us to assess the impact of contemporary politics or Gregorian ideals on Roman pictorial programmes of the first third of the twelfth century and in particular on the mosaics of San Clemente. In this programme, no popes of the reformation were depicted, nor the contemporary pope of the mosaics, probably Paschal II. Furthermore, St. Clement was dressed as an apostle and not as a pope, unlike the depiction surviving in the church of a few decades or even years earlier. He was therefore presented as the heir of St. Peter and probably also as a representative of the Apostolic Church which was exalted by the Gregorian Church, and not as a contemporary pope wearing the pallium, the symbol of his authority.

The second part aims to show the liturgical meanings and functions fulfilled by the mosaics. Since the sixth century, and probably earlier, the mosaics of apsidal arches Roman churches referred to the heavenly liturgy. They thus establish an echo with the Eucharistic liturgy practised at the earthly altar beneath the image. This is also suggested by part of the programme of San Clemente, which focuses on the Adoration of Christ by the Four Living creature of Revelation, the Crucifixion as well as the Gloria and the vine mentioned in the inscriptions.

Moreover, another inscription suggests that a relic of the True Cross was inserted in the masonry. Whether this was true or not, the point is that the great Crucifixion was considered a stauotheque, as were other wooden or gilded crucifixes such as the Volto Santo, which recent analysis places in the 8th-9th centuries, or the Gero crucifix in Cologne. The image must therefore have served as a support for the adoration of the cross on Good Friday, as in Santa Maria Antiqua, and probably on the occasion of the Invention, the Exaltation and the *Passio imaginis Domini* celebrated on 9 November.

The third part of the paper concerns devotion. The canons and the faithful must have prayed daily before the Crucifixion and the bust of Christ in the apse arch. In Rome, images and texts also testify to a remarkable devotion to monumental mosaics or wall paintings. One of the most striking sources is a long letter written by Pope Adrian I in response to Carolingian reticence about the veneration of images, where he states that the faithful adored the images in the great basilicas, including the Adoration of the Elders at San Paolo fuori le Mura. Another indication of these practices is found when icons were transposed on a monumental scale. The most obvious example is the Madonna della Clemenza, which was transposed onto a wall on three occasions: on Alfano's tomb, in the San Nicola chapel in the Lateran and, with important variations, in Santa Maria in Trastevere. The example of Alfano's tomb in Santa Maria in Cosmedin attests in particular that the patron placed his hopes of salvation in the intervention of this famous icon. As far as the image of Christ is concerned, the Lateran acheiropoietic icon should be mentioned, of which many copies were made from around 1100 onwards and which may have been transposed to the apse of Pisa Cathedral.

The most remarkable example, however, comes from a monumental image: the face of Christ represented in the apse of the Lateran Basilica, which is an acheiropoietic image that appeared on the day of the consecration. Several visual and epigraphic components suggest that the programme of San Clemente was largely inspired by this model, starting with the superimposition of a cross and a bust of Christ. It can therefore be assumed that the devotion to the Lateran image was transposed to that of San Clemente. This is especially likely since the inscriptions on the apse arch associated with the figures of St. Clement and St. Lawrence and their gestures explicitly invite to contemplate the Christ and to adore the cross.

Finally, several clues suggest that the image of Christ dying on the cross was intended to evoke empathy, a new feeling that seems to have emerged across the Alps from the 1020s and even earlier in the Pre-Conquest England. In the *Annales Alamannici*, we learn that in 921, the image of Christ on the cross adjoining the altar began to weep to the point of forming a stream of tears when the Passion was read. Anselm of Lucca, a fervent defender of the Reformation, also favoured a piety marked by compassion and an identification with the protagonists of the holy story. It can therefore be assumed that in San Clemente, the dead Christ on the cross was depicted to support devotion by arousing the compassion of the faithful and the clergy.

This programme thus has an exceptionally wide and diverse semantic and functional field. It is not impossible that it was also dedicated to defending the ideals of the Gregorian reform, but if it was this hypothetical message would only be one of its many facets.

Armin Bergmeier

Linear time and narrative in the Anagni crypt frescoes

This paper considers the significance of the positioning of images and their relation to time in the Anagni crypt frescoes, placing the frescoes at a critical juncture in the history of the understanding of time and history. It posits that the frescoes are not part of one coherent painting campaign, but were executed in two campaigns, the first likely in the first half of the twelfth century and the second in the last quarter of the twelfth century. While the “original” plan envisioned the typological juxtaposition of scenes from biblical and post-biblical history, the extant fresco decoration orders biblical, post-biblical, and future events in a linear, teleological progression. Such a narrative chain of events, combining otherwise unrelated stories, was unprecedented at the time and marks an intellectual change in how time and history were understood; the past had come to be regarded as separated from the present but connected to it through causality and the succession of events constructed along an imagined linear time-line.

The paper will substantiate the claim for a twelfth-century date and suggest a possible narrative flow (itinerary) through the space, which culminated in the apocalyptic imagery in the apse.

Andrea Worm

Narrative and Argument: The Emergence of Typological Cycles in the Twelfth Century

In the twelfth century a type of imagery emerges that blends narrative and argumentative models into a new structure. Early evidence for this is in stained glass, where the Tree of Jesse becomes ‘historiated’, and where the material framework seems to have invited an experimental and innovative narrative structure. Typological narrative is understood as a type of narrative that moves forward horizontally and at the same time into different strata of salvation history. The proposed paper will explore the emergence and increasing systematisation of typological narrative, its relation to the conception of history, and its emergence and dissemination, from what appears to be its heartland in the Rhine-Meuse region, through models and texts.

Kristin Aavitsland

Micro-Architecture and Storytelling in Twelfth-Century Churches in Medieval Scandinavia

This paper explores the role of architectural representation in visual narratives in the interiors of twelfth-century parish churches in medieval Scandinavia, notably in Denmark. The material examined includes murals as well as reliefs in stone (portals and baptismal fonts) and metal (altar frontals and reliquaries), wherein architectural representations occur either as framing devices or as scenographic ‘props’ within the narrative scenes depicted. Assuming that the consistent use of architectural motifs in ecclesiastical art in this period does have a role to play in the production of theological and liturgical meaning, the paper analyzes them as a distinct rhetorical feature.

In order to reach a better understanding of the abundant architectural motifs in the narratives visualized in the churches, the term *micro-architecture* may be apt as a critical concept. This term was coined in the 1970s by François Bucher to describe Gothic church furniture, reliquaries, monstrances and other liturgical objects, whose design features miniature building elements such as portals, cupolas, spires, and pinnacles. The application of the term has since expanded to periods other than the Gothic and to cultural settings beyond that of medieval Christianity; analyses of micro-architecture has recently been in vogue in the study of medieval visual culture. Not least has it proved relevant for the paradigm preceding Gothic, capturing significant dimensions in the rhetoric and meaning in the production of Romanesque ecclesiastical art. Architectural vocabularies provided the Romanesque *ars sacra* – and hence the liturgical space – with a repertoire that connoted to authoritative building design in the Roman and Byzantine tradition. Moreover, as a rhetorical structuring device (*dispositio*) for visualised semantic narratives and arguments, micro-architecture offered *multum in parvo*, enabling complex stories to be told and multifaceted theological contents to be summarised in a limited space. This is very much the case with Scandinavian ecclesiastical art from the long twelfth century. The paper presents and contextualizes selected cases across different media.

Tancredi Bella and Giulia Arcidiacono

The Mosaics of the Palatine Chapel of Palermo and the Cathedral of Monreale: Relations, Interactions, Strategies

The mosaics of the Palatine Chapel in Palermo, consecrated in 1140 in the presence of King Roger II, and those of the Cathedral of Monreale, founded by his nephew Guglielmo II, reflect the multicultural physiognomy of the Norman kingdom of Sicily and constitute a privileged instrument of Royal political propaganda. In this contribution, the programme of the two buildings will be analyzed with particular reference to the ways in which storytelling is used. Focusing specifically on the Old Testament scenes and taking certain key examples, we will endeavour to highlight the visual mechanisms and expedients aimed which give direction, temporality and meaning of the figurative narrative. In the case of the Palatine Chapel reference will be made to the selective use of models and their creative reworking, to the internal dynamics that connect and clarify the meaning of the programme, and to the correspondences of gestures, schemes, and figurative formulae. These in turn create sophisticated relationships between architectural space and figurative space. In the case of the Cathedral of Monreale, we will draw attention to both points of contact and differences with the Palatine Chapel programme, its immediate precedent, in the context of the cultural policy of King William II.

TUESDAY 29 MARCH

Arturo Carlo Quintavalle

The Commission and Politics of Images in 12th-Century Northern Italy: From the Investiture Controversy to the Fight Against Heresy

Between the end of the 11th century and the beginning of the 12th century we can observe a remarkable change in the use of sculpture on the exterior of cathedrals, abbeys and other churches in Northern Italy. We must rely in this instance on sculpture because the majority of the painted cycles that existed in the interiors haven't survived the test of time. This change is linked to the Investiture Controversy and the confrontation between the Gregorian Church and the Empire. The revolution began in a specific workshop, that of Wiligelmus, which was active between 1090 and roughly 1110-1115, first in San Benedetto al Polirone Abbey, then at the abbey of Nonantola, and finally at Modena cathedral, as well as other locations. The sculpted narration begins with the re-writing of the Lives of Saints and with the introduction of the *Chanson de Geste*, as well as the adoption of different approach to the symbology of time and work throughout the months. In this fashion, the life of Saint Geminianus on the south portal at Modena cathedral was rewritten by partially remodelling it on the life of Saint Zeno, whose life went on to be sculpted around 1138 in San Zeno in Verona by Nicholas, Wiligelmus' greatest pupil. Both the lives of Geminianus and Zeno emphasise the miraculous voyage of the two saints to the Eastern Christian Empire, which serves as an obvious contrast with the Roman-Germanic empire against which the Church in the west was fighting.

Nicholaus was a fundamental figure in the development of the new narrative. His workshop was active from the 1120s to the 1140s in both the north and in central Italy, covering a variety of projects ranging from the abbey of San Michele in the Val di Susa to Piacenza Cathedral, Verona (San Zeno and Cathedral) and Fano Cathedral. Over the first decades of the 12th century, in France as well as in northern and central Italy, the Cathar heresy spread quickly, as had the heresy of Pier de Bruy in Provence. These two heretical movements rejected the very structure of the Roman Catholic Church and its sacraments, while their adherents believed the world had been created by the devil. In consequence, the extensive sculptural cycles of Nicholas at San Zeno in Verona created a blatantly anti-cathar discourse. Indeed, on the right side of the façade's portal Nicholas sculpts God's creation of the world, while on the opposite side, Guilielmus depicts Christ on the Cross, the very cross that the Cathars and Pier de Bruy rejected.

The images represented in the large sculptural cycles in Ile de France, at Saint Denis, Chartres and Notre Dame in Paris (Porte Sainte Anne) and then in Provence and Aquitaine after the so-called Albigenian Crusade, introduce an iconographic revolution that is a programmatic rejection of Cathar theories. A similar, profound change occurred in Italy during the last decades of the 12th century and at the beginning of the 13th century, starting with the *portile* at Modena Cathedral around 1180, Benedetto Antelami's pulpit in the Parma Cathedral (1178), the façade of Borgo San Donnino (now Fidenza) of the 1190s, and the Parma Baptistery complex (c.1196-1220) as linked to the work of "Benedictus Antelami dictus". The great themes of the anti-cathar narrative are clear in the Parma Baptistery: the tympanum with the Final Judgment, the Acts of Mercy, the Virgin Mary serving as a link between Heaven and Earth. From that moment onwards, thanks to Antelami, a new model was created for portals which depicted human labour as a sign of the divine on earth. The portal of the months in Parma became the model for those at Cremona, Borgo San Donnino, San Marco in Venice, Ferrara cathedral, Trogir in Dalmatia (by Radovan) and many others, all to be dated between 1200 and 1240. The culmination of the anti-cathar message can be seen in the great

sculpted images of the Virgin Mary in Borgo San Donnino (originally located on the main altar), in Sant'Andrea at Vercelli, and in the Virgin (now in a private collection), a little-known work by Antelami himself, which was originally located on the altar of the Parma cathedral.

This, over a period of roughly a century, from the beginning to the end of the 12th century, the meaning of images changed completely: from conflict with the empire to the fight against the cathar heresy. Yet, in cathedrals and abbeys alike, the *chanson de geste* is always represented. At Modena, an Arthurian episode is depicted on the Pescheria porta; at Verona Cathedral we find the *Chanson de Roland* with statues of Roland and Oliver on the façade; at Borgo San Donnino, in the south tower, we see an episode from Roland's youth, as Emile Mâle first suggested in 1922. The cathedrals have a deeply religious narrative and, as Èmile Bréhier suggested in his research on *Chanson de Gestes*, the relics of the protagonists of the chansons were worshipped in churches in Italy and France. Thus, all three periods indicated above, the beginning, sculptural narrative appears to be strongly linked to the requests of clients that the various sculpture workshops managed by Wiligelmus, Nicholaus and Benedictus Antelami dictus depended on.

Deborah Kahn

Promoting Conformity: The Role of the Church in the Revival of Sculpture

Early-11th-century carvings of saints and apocalyptic visions in Capetian territories are well known. The representation of current events in the earliest narrative sculpture of the Romanesque period at Saint-Germain-des-Prés in Paris, Saint-Benoît-sur-Loire and Selles-sur-Cher, on the other hand, has gone virtually without comment. These depictions of the contemporary focused on the perceived enemies of the Eucharist. They include carvings of Muslims killing Christians, endorsements of the veracity of the Eucharist, and an extraordinary illustration of a conspiracy theory involving Jews in the destruction of the Holy Sepulchre, a rumour only previously known from the written histories of Adémar de Chabannes and Raoul Glaber. The appearance of these narrative carvings broadly coincides with the burning of heretics in 1022 at Orléans and attacks on Jewish communities across France in the lead up to the Crusades.

Attempts to raise alarm about the adversaries of Orthodox Catholicism may have played a greater role in the regeneration of narrative in architectural sculpture around 1020 than previously acknowledged. The revitalization of sculpture was evidently motivated in part by the effectiveness of the medium, as a means to endorse the views of Capetian rulers and their brothers in the Church, to discourage deviance and to promote conformity. The emergence of these images coincides with what Bob Moore termed 'the formation of a persecuting society'. In the face of the perceived attack on the Eucharist the new technology where stories projected into space and were concrete was the most effective medium of permanence then available to demonize and present the enemies of the Eucharist as at once tangible and terrifying.

Jessica Berenbeim

Letter-form and literary form: Epigraphic script in manuscripts

This paper explores an aspect of the epigraphic culture of England and France in the eleventh and twelfth centuries. Specifically, it examines distinctive uses of 'epigraphic' display scripts—that is,

manuscript letter-forms inflected by the forms of monumental inscriptions—to articulate the structures of texts.

The concerns of the paper will therefore contribute to the conference’s broader discussion, by investigating how the image of the letter defines the narrative of a text. In what way do these evocative letter-forms bring object-specific meaning to an individual manuscript’s expression of a literary work? How might epigraphic literary paratexts, and the control they exert on the reception of narratives, relate to the interpretive effects of monumental inscriptions in architectural space?

The paper offers a brief overview of these questions, with particular attention to the ways that different disciplines have characterized these kinds of textual elements. Its analysis then turns in more detail to some especially revealing examples, and the connections they suggest between manuscript and monumental writing in twelfth-century England and France.

Robert Maxwell

The Narrative Time of Dreams

The twelfth century saw a dramatic rise in history writing — chronicles, cartularies, epics, genealogies — but illuminations at first made only a timid appearance alongside these texts. Some of the better known among these have been well studied (the Chronicle of Ekkehard of Aura, for example), but images in historical manuscripts remain relatively understudied. The BAA Conference is a welcome opportunity to consider their imagery within the larger issue of narrative imagery.

This paper concerns pictorial histories in some decorated cartularies and chronicles and focuses on one recurring motif that raises several special problems: dreams. Dream-visions are not uncommon in saintly histories or heroic epics, but they can complicate a pictorial narrative, particularly in chronicles and cartularies. Dream episodes typically interrupt the narrative to set the dreamer—and the story itself—on an altered course. They also typically introduce a different mode of time into the historical trajectory, for the dream may re-situate the dreamer in the past or address his future. The shift in temporality is thus at odds with history’s otherwise linear march.

This paper argues that dreams and visions open the “space” of history-writing: they create gaps in the historical narrative that disrupt the narrative’s otherwise seamless tale. The success of the historical dream vision, as recounted in text and image, depends precisely on how it fills that “space” and how it generates its own narrative.

I considered some of these issues in a study of the mid-twelfth century Chronicle of John of Worcester (*The Medieval Chronicle*, 9, 2014), but the aim of this paper is to expand the scope of inquiry. Doing so may allow several working hypotheses on the place of pictured dreams in historical narratives. Examples drawn from the cartularies of Mont-St.-Michel and Santiago de Compostela, among others, offer insights of a more theoretical nature into the problem of picturing dreams in narrative contexts.

Manuel Castiñeiras

Narrative strategies, the senses and iter in pilgrimage sites: Conques, Compostela and Bethlehem

In the 12th century, pilgrimage sites in both Western Europe and the Holy Land attached great importance to the display of images and texts which accompanied pilgrims on their *iter* to the shrine. To this end, different visual strategies were developed to lead the visitor into the relevant building, highlight its holiness and fulfil the desire of pilgrims to experience the sacred. Evocative sceneries, carved portals with assertive inscriptions, statues of the patron saint, body-shaped reliquaries or even commemorative painted portraits were intended to single out the different pilgrimage sites and make them unique for the visitor.

The paper will analyse three cases - Conques, Compostela and Bethlehem - where elements such as circulation, rites, the repetition of images and varied multi-sensory experience seem to have shaped a distinctive site-specific 'narrative'. In all three, the sight-appeal of images cannot be isolated from other sensory perceptions, like the sound of running water in a fountain following a long journey, the hearing of admonitive sermons, accounts of miracles, traveller accounts and 'guide' stories encountered on the way, or the development of a 'kinesthetic consciousness' of the body based on the performance of certain pilgrim rites and ceremonies.

From this perspective, the sculpted portals of Conques and Santiago de Compostela should be assessed as part of monumental network, in which the exterior is connected with the ornamentation of the shrine. At Conques, the dialogue with the celebrated statue of Sainte Foy, its miracles, legends and performative rites, is included in the narrative of the portal. Conversely, from the perspective of one's first approach, Compostela based its peculiar sense of holiness on a series of Old Testament references from north to south in direct competition with Rome and Jerusalem. However, the transformations in the basilica at the end of the 12th century created a new longitudinal axis in which the repetition of the statue of saint James and the elders of the Apocalypse wove a new pilgrim experience into the narrative of the site.

Notwithstanding the above, the most compelling case of a connection between devotional images and *iter* is the series of depictions of saints accompanied by pilgrims/donors in the basilica of Nativity in Bethlehem. This arrangement should be considered in relation to Early Christian and Byzantine practice at pilgrimage sites, in which *graffiti* and *charisteria* constituted an everlasting bond between donors and shrines.

Irene Caracciolo

A Comparative Analysis of the 'tecnica mista' panel portraits inserted into certain wall paintings in Romanesque Italy

This paper focuses on the insertion of wooden panel heads in wall painting in Romanesque Italy; *tecnica mista* as it was first termed by Pierluigi Leone De Castris. During the restoration of the ancient church of Santa Restituta in Naples, Leone De Castris detected a scattered medieval layer beneath the 16th-century paintings in the apse and discovered circular wooden panels had been inserted within the medieval wall paintings. These corresponded with the faces of the angels, the evangelists and - the only example remaining visible today - Christ. Were all six panels made by an expert workshop, perhaps a Greek one based in Constantinople? Is the panel of Christ's face an

ancient painting reused in the apse renovation? If so, does the panel have a special devotional value as an icon?

As it happens, the panel and the wall painting are contemporary. But is there a historiographical reason why it would be appropriate to fake an antique and also Byzantine (as 16th and 17th-century Neapolitan erudites describe it) insertion? Santa Restituta is unique for having preserved a circular panel within its decoration, but is not isolated. There is a group of monuments which adopted this peculiar technique in Naples and the surrounding area (Caivano, and the Amalfi Coast) to the point that it seems that the *tecnica mista* became a fashion around 1200. Despite the early date of the first evidence for the deployment of wooden circular panels in the position of the head of a sacred figure in the 10th century (frescoes in the crypt of the Cave church of Santa Maria de Olearia (Maiori, SA) and perhaps within the Church of the Madonna dell'Idria in San Gregorio Armeno (Naples) – cases multiply between the end of the eleventh and the twelfth centuries, if we involve more strictly narrative painted cycles. Indeed, after Campania three examples well known to scholars are the fresco decoration of San Pietro a Monte Civate (Como), the church of San Giovanni a Porta Latina in Rome and San Pietro in Valle a Ferentillo. In addition, some cases can be detected in the region of Umbria. How did this mechanism of representation work within the Romanesque narrative of these cycles? Are the questions raised for Santa Restituta appropriate in order to evaluate the wider spread of the phenomenon in different territories and cultural context?

Herbert Kessler investigated the phenomenon in relation to the frescoes at San Pietro in Valle a Ferentillo, concluding that the panels corresponding with the faces of the most venerated sacred figures were intended to avoid confusion between the real Image and the one represented. On the other hand, Giorgia Corso pointed out that the panel of Christ in Santa Restituta, which omits the neck, was inserted as a *vera imago* and almost stood as a relic for the veneration of worshippers. Herbert Kessler and Giorgia Corso agree (only) on the suggestion that the deployment of this technique was intended to deliver a message to the viewer, but which message? Is the diverse material intended to indicate a different nature in representation? It is possible to describe these panels as housed in wall paintings but one could reverse this, and consider the wall to be a receptacle which contains them? If so, is there a relationship between panels in a wall and the spread of 'case panels'; that is panel paintings with a hidden spot for relics (the Madonna by Montano d'Arezzo in the sanctuary of Montevergine, for instance, the Crucifix by Sotio from Santi Giovanni e Paolo in Spoleto and the Crucifix in Santa Maria Maggiore in Florence)?

Analyzing the material nature of this technique – the lacunae and the few panels preserved, the way in which panels were installed in the wall – the iconographic programs in which the panels were included and also the historical and cultural background of the sites, this paper aims to detect similarities and differences in the deployment of this curious device and to deepen the many (old and new) questions on the subject.

Mina Miyamoto

A Problem of Identification in Folio 1v. of the Salzburg Pericopes (Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Clm 15713)

The Benedictine Archabbey of St. Peter in Salzburg (founded 696) is the oldest monastery in the German-speaking world which continues in use as a working monastery. In the course of the 11th century its monastic scriptorium produced a series of magnificent manuscripts. The writing and painting style characteristic of this scriptorium shows similarities to work produced in scriptoria

attached to Benedictine Abbeys in Regensburg and Seeon, neither very far from Salzburg, though notwithstanding these links, the Salzburg scriptorium's production is distinctive.

The manuscript which is the focus of this paper - the *Salzburg Pericopes* (Clm 15713) - was created around 1020 at St. Peter in Salzburg for use at Salzburg Cathedral. The upper part of Folio 1v illustrates a scene from the life of the Virgin Mary, a representation which appears to be unique in the liturgical book and the visual arts of the time. It stands out not only because of its content, but for its position at the beginning of the Pericopes and its unique composition. Since Georg Swarzenski published the image in 1901, scholars have assumed that the scene depicted is the *Presentation of Mary to the Temple* and for a long time only this one thesis was pursued in research. However, in 1997 Ulrich Kuder suggested the miniature might have been intended to represent the *Betrothal of the Virgin Mary* in combination with the *Coronation by the angel*.

My paper will focus on this iconographical problem of scene identification. In order to examine the scene in sufficient detail, I analyse the contemporaneous iconographic tradition of the *Presentation of Mary to the Temple*, the *Betrothal* and, especially, the *Coronation*. By comparing it with depictions of the Salzburg *Virgin Mary*, I explore the significance of the depiction and ask why such an extraordinary image of the Virgin Mary was placed at the beginning of a book of Pericopes. In conclusion, I contrast this representation with other contemporaneous depictions of the veneration of the Virgin Mary.

Gaetano Curzi

Nature, landscape, and hagiography on the facade of San Clemente a Casauria

In 1078 the Norman count Ugo Malmozzetto destroyed San Clemente a Casauria in the Abruzzi, erasing the abbey founded by the emperor Ludovico II in 871 and rebuilt by Abbots Guido and Trasmondo, following destruction by the Saracens in 911 and an earthquake in 990 respectively. Thus, 1078 is year zero for us. Indeed, excluding the crypt, whose date is uncertain, nothing survives of the earlier buildings in the monumental church built between the end of the 11th century and the beginning of the 12th.

Construction reached a peak in the 1170s and 1180s, when the facade was built. Its architectural forms, the story of its sculptures and the texts of its inscriptions, constitute an ideological manifesto for the monastic community which was mirrored, in these same years, by the compilation of the abbey's famous *Chronicon*. According to the latter source, in 1176 Abbot Leonate completely renewed the front of the church by erecting a facade with three portals and immediately afterwards a portico with an elevated oratory dedicated to Thomas Becket. This was still to be consecrated when on the death of Leonate in 1182, the abbacy passed to Gioele, who completed the work and closed the principal west portal with a monumental bronze door. The chronology of the construction is thus tightly dated and the facade seems to respond to a very precise design logic, confirmed by subtle cross-references in its various parts, so much so that we can examine it as a unitary whole.

This paper aims to show how the transport of the relics of San Clemente from Rome, illustrated on the lintel of the main portal, alludes to the martyrdom of the saint in the Black Sea and to a supernatural will that the relics be kept at San Clemente a Casauria which, in the Middle Ages, stood on an island formed by the waters of the Pescara River. For this reason, the iconographic programme of the portal and the bronze door, as well as the sculptures and inscriptions of the portico, are

enriched with references to nature and the surrounding landscape – a local topography which was presented as a metaphor for earthly paradise. However, this attention to the environmental context also reveals a cultural attitude and a sensitivity of an almost "ecological" character, traces of which can also be found in the text of the abbey's Chronicon.

Claude Andraut-Schmitt

An Unusual Scenography in the Service of Popular Devotion: The Cenotaph at Saint-Hilaire-de-la-Celle in Poitiers

In the middle of the 12th century, the regular canons of St-Hilaire-de-la-Celle in Poitiers wished to celebrate the saint whose tomb was in another church of the city - the famous St-Hilaire-le-Grand. They ordered a carved memorial evoking the death bed of the saint to be made, because the site of their church was believed to correspond to the bishop's family house (*cella*), which was where he died. As with the shrine of St Lazare at Autun, the memorial was a significant structure before its dismemberment in the 16th century, and was built with a little western stair which enabled pilgrims to pass underneath.

Besides members of the parish of St-Hilaire-de-la-Celle *stricto sensu*, for a long time all the inhabitants of Poitiers had the expensive right to be buried inside this church or the adjacent monastery, that is to say close to the death bed of the patron saint of the city.

The iconography of the monument emphasized a representation of the burial (a surviving relief) together with two now missing scenes: one an enigma, the other being the miracle of the 'synod of Seleucia' denouncing the Arian heresy and which is reported in the *Liber sancti Jacobi*. The overall iconography was consequently, as far as we know, both funerary and narrative in a political sense. The carved reliefs were supplemented by statues, some contemporary with the monument, others belonging to the later aisleless nave which served as an impressive setting for the carved monument. Contrary to usual practice, the cenotaph was not set within an ambulatory or apse but in the middle of the nave, and was positioned in association with the parochial altar. The western part of the church no longer exists, but the documentation allows us to imagine a theatrical visibility from the main door, because of the existence of a staircase constructed to cope with the underlying slope.

WEDNESDAY 30 MARCH

Wilfried E. Keil

The narrative frieze of Saint Dominus on the façade of Fidenza Cathedral

Fidenza Cathedral was rebuilt following the great earthquake of 1117. The façade is generally attributed to Benedetto Antelami, though only two sculptures standing in niches between the portals, King David and Ezekiel, are attributed to Antelami himself. The main portal deploys a frieze above the capital zone, which is continued at the same height in the architrave and to the left and right of the portal as far as the two columns between the main portal and the side portals. The frieze depicts scenes from the life of the cathedral's patron saint, Saint Dominus, within which are inscriptions, some of the very subtly integrated into the depictions, and hardly noticeable at first sight from a distance.

Domninus was chamberlain to the Emperor Maximian in Trier. After converting to Christianity, he had to flee from the emperor's wrath. During his escape to his homeland, he was captured and beheaded near Fidenza. According to the legend, he then took his own head in his hands and crossed the river Stirone to lay his head where the cathedral now stands.

The cycle is accompanied by other friezes and individual scenes and sculptures, the content of which, together with the cycle of the saint, relate in a complex way to the salvation of souls. Among these other scenes are episodes from the Old and New Testaments, some of them integrated into an eschatological programme, as often happens in portals, and individual scenes from antiquity or depictions of Pope Adrian II and of Charlemagne. To left and right, the façade is completed with towers on which there are friezes related by height to friezes elsewhere on the facade. The New Testament cycle begins on the northern tower and continues above the reliefs of the legend of Saint Domninus. On the southern tower, on the other hand, scenes are depicted which relate to Charlemagne, which have not been interpreted satisfactorily in earlier research.

The connections between the cycle of the Saint Domninus and the biblical cycle are remarkable. The accumulation of depictions of rulers is particularly striking. The arrangement ensures readability in multiple ways. On the one hand, the individual narrative cycles (Domninus, Bible, Charlemagne), can be read discreetly; in addition, they create an eschatology and at another level double they create a complex network of relationships depending on the knowledge of the viewer. They are intentionally polysemous.

Since Fidenza is also a place of pilgrimage, it can be assumed that, as at other pilgrimage centres, clerics were available to explain the façade programme to pilgrims and may have used the inscriptions in various ways to support their readings. The statue of Peter on the left column points towards the Via Francigena and thus to Peter's shrine at Rome.

It is not possible to explain this complex programme in detail in a short talk. My paper will therefore focus on the cycle of Saint Domninus and its many-layered links with the other cycles. The programme's potential 'pictorial effects' ('Bildwirkungen') will also be considered. The aim is to make clear that the portal programme was deliberately conceived for different groups of viewers, each of whom would see it operating on different levels. The identification of individual figures will also be taken into account.

Carles Sánchez Márquez

A Roman Saint in Catalonia: Sant Llorenç Dosmunts and the shaping of devotional images through Romanesque altar frontals

Catalan museums preserve the largest and oldest collection of panel paintings in Europe. The most fascinating group of these is undoubtedly that of the oldest altar frontals or *antependia*, mostly dating from the 12th century. These altar frontals constitute one of the most interesting early schools of painting in Western Europe, comparable to early Italian panel paintings and crosses as well as to icons from the eastern Mediterranean.

During the 12th century, altar frontals became a type of mass-media whereby both narrative and devotional images were shown to the faithful. They were positioned in a privileged and highly

visible place – at the high altar – and were usually accompanied by inscriptions that facilitated the viewers' understanding. Some of these frontals are remarkably inventive in their iconography. This is certainly the case with the frontal from Sant Llorenç de Dosmunts (Museu Episcopal de Vic). This contains hagiographical images of Saint Lawrence (died c.258), one of the seven deacons of the city of Rome supposedly martyred during the persecution of Christians ordered by the Emperor Valerian. In the case of Catalonia, documentary evidence points to an early cult of the saint, to whom numerous churches were dedicated.

The following case study case-study raises new questions concerning the making of Catalan altar frontals. What was the function of *antependia*? Were they simply a support, a means of carrying images and stories, or rather were they sacred objects in their own right?

John McNeill

From Image to Narrative at Saint-Aubin, Angers

The Romanesque chapter-house façade of Saint-Aubin at Angers consists of twelve arched openings flanking a portal. It is asymmetrical and elaborately carved, but while the sculpture of the northern arches does not appear to have been arranged as an iconographic 'programme' that of the southern arches was. This develops from south to north, bringing the observer from scenes of David slaying Goliath to an image of the Virgin and Child by the chapter-house entrance. It has a discernable directional momentum, underlined by sculptural repeats and framing devices. Although undated, the sculpture is consistent and relates to work in the Poitou of the 1120s or early 1130s. The arches below the image of the Virgin and Child carry a narrative cycle in paint, depicting the journey of the Magi, audience with Herod, Adoration and Massacre of the Innocents. Stylistically this appears later, and arguably intruded a narrative mode into an iconographical frame formerly focused on the Virgin as 'imperatrix angelorum et hominum' (Geoffrey of Vendôme).

Most recent studies have assumed the sculpture and the painting to be contemporary – but this seems unlikely. Not only is the stylistic register of the sculpture and the painting different, the paintings divorce the image of the Virgin and Child from its sculptural context. This paper examines why this might have occurred. The architectural antecedents for Saint-Aubin's chapter-house façade can be found in the description of the chapter-house in the Cluniac *Consuetudines Farvenses* and it may be significant that it is in these circles that the role of the Virgin Mary in chapter meetings is stressed. The subsequent shift away from a loose iconographical scheme that showcased the virtuoso techniques developed by early 12th-century western French sculptors towards a compressed feast cycle suggests a new interest in monastic 'performance', as well as hinting at a perceived inadequacy in the recently completed work. The modification of sculptural compositions by the addition of new figures or scenes within a generation of their completion is an aspect of 12th-century art which perhaps deserves greater recognition than it has been accorded.

Barbara Franzé

Image and Narrative in the Cloister at Moissac in the light of the Consecration Ritual

The cloister of Moissac (c. 1100), with its 76 figured capitals, is organized around eight pillars. As Régis de la Haye (1991) and Maria Cristina Pereira (2008) have observed, the iconography of the

pillars allows them to be grouped in pairs, forming a network of lines linking the two diagonals to the two perpendiculars. These four lines are also the ones that, in my opinion, are drawn on the floor of the church during its consecration. The last element of the geometric formula, the enclosing circle, is materialized by the galleries of the cloister. When the monks, but also the faithful, left the church for the cloister and the chapter house located in the middle of the eastern gallery, they reactivated the dynamics of the consecration ritual.

The iconography of the capitals echoes the ritual, and the meaning proposed by the exegetes: according to them, the circuits practiced in the church are assimilated to the history of the Church, from its foundation with the death of Christ on the cross to the gathering of the two peoples of the elect, which will occur at the end of time. In the eastern gallery, the ornate space is reserved for the figures of martyred saints: as in Berzé-la-Ville, they refer to the origins of the Church and, by their association, to its universality. In the south gallery, at the end of a circular path leading to the east gallery, the capitals are decorated with apocalyptic scenes or scenes alluding to the final events: they thus situate the Church in its state of completion. The last capital is dedicated to Saint Peter, freed from his prison by the angel. For the exegetes, the episode symbolizes the soul freed from its sins and temptations, freeing itself from its mortal envelope to join the society of the faithful. This interpretation is an indication of the knowledge of Christian Platonism in Moissac, and its use by the designer of the programme: for pseudo-Denys the Areopagite and John Scott Erigenus, the liberation of the soul is the last stage in the process of returning to God.

Béla Zsolt Szakács

From Rome to Somogyvár: Transforming the Spinario

The celebrated sculpture of a naked young boy - the *Spinario* or Boy with a Thorn (Rome, Musei Capitolini) - is the only surviving Antique nude sculpture not originating from excavations. While its medieval and modern afterlife has been extensively researched, a strange Romanesque copy from medieval Hungary is completely unknown to international scholarship. The 12th-century relief, found in the ruins of the Benedictine Abbey of Somogyvár, is unique in its composition: the *Spinario* is combined with a battle with a lion. The scene was interpreted in earlier local research as Jerome with a lion; or Daniel in the lion's den; as an unknown martyr; as Samson and the lion; and as Samson withdrawing a thorn from his foot. Since none of these interpretations is convincing, a new explanation will be based on a thorough investigation of its iconographical context.

The Hungarian *Spinario* is an outstanding example of the transformation of forms and ideas brought about by diffusion and reception within a new culture. The Antique composition was in use in the Middle Ages, most popularly perhaps in western France, although it was not particularly frequently encountered. As far as I know, the representation of the boy with a thorn at Somogyvár is unique in east central Europe. The relief dates from the last decades of the 12th century. While the Roman sculpture is a single, free-standing piece, the Somogyvár version is part of a relief cycle. As part of this transformation, the left leg was given a tortured position, vaguely resembling representations of acrobats. There are significant changes in the form and consequently meaning, too. The naked boy has been dressed and has lost any sexual connotation. While the original composition represents the boy alone, at Somogyvár he is accompanied with a lion. It was part of a series of reliefs, consisting of the figures of Christ, an angel, St Peter, Samson with the lion, and a griffon.

Thus, the *Spinario* composition was moved to an explicitly Christian environment. The boy taking out the thorn from his leg can be understood as the human soul freed from the sin. In this way, the motif of the *Spinario* was moved not only in space and time but also in meaning. The stress is not on the body but on the soul. One of the most typical Hellenistic compositions, it became an ideal expression of the Christian soul looking for salvation. The fight with the lion has a similar meaning: a combat with the devil. The two symbolic elements point to the same direction. For the medieval viewer, perhaps the *Spinario* and its Christian interpretation was not obvious, at least not at Somogyvár. The additional motif, the ‘roaring lion looking for someone to devour’ (1 Peter 5:8) is a typical Romanesque iconographic element. However, what was intended to make the meaning clearer for the 12th-century viewer, works in an opposite way for modern viewers. For researchers educated in Classical art, the combination of the *Spinario* with a lion is a visual nonsense and remains a mystery. The true meaning of the *Spinario* of Somogyvár can be fully understood only in relation to the symbolic language of the Romanesque world

Yael Barash

From Sin to Redemption: Narratives, Abstract Conclusions and Compositions in Hildegard of Bingen's Illustrations

Are images invested with singular meanings, or are they intentionally polysemous? The illustrations of Hildegard of Bingen's *Scivias* demonstrate how complex an answer to this question might be. Hildegard (1098-1179) documented the divine visions she experienced in three books; *Scivias* is the first. Each vision in the *Scivias* starts with a documentation of the vision's sights, followed by a commentary on those sights, which Hildegard received from a divine voice. Only one codex was illustrated during Hildegard's lifetime – the Wiesbaden Codex (c. 1160-1180). The illustrations in this codex raise questions about how they function in relation to the text from the perspective of both narrative and abstract conclusions. As the miniatures illustrate a documentation of visual visions, many scholars referred to them as a visual documentation of the divine visions. However, this approach cannot fully explain the structure and details of the illustrations; many of the visions include a sequence of events, while the illustrations themselves are a static medium.

The commentaries, which Hildegard miraculously heard, identify objects in the visions and give them a theological or philosophical meaning. The commentaries touch upon major issues in 12th-century Renaissance intellectual discourse. This includes the development of time through narratives of the History of Salvation from the creation of the world, through the fall of man, the incarnation, and on until the last days. Thus, the narratives of the visions are combined with the narratives of the History of Salvation. The different narratives in each illustration integrate into a shared abstract conclusion and ethical morals. In this paper, I will seek to show that the design of the illustrations is primarily affected by the meaning of the visions. Thus, the design gives priority to the commentaries on a vision, and not their description. In addition, by passing through the codex, different illustrations are combined into an additional narrative in the viewer's mind. This combined narrative, which covers the abstract conclusion of each illustration, shows how humans can move from sin to redemption. In addition, by passing through the codex, the different illustrations are combined into an additional narrative in the viewer's mind. This combined narrative, which covers the abstract conclusion of each illustration, shows how humans can move from sin to redemption.

Alison Locke Perchuk

Narrative Sequences of the Apocalypse in Romanesque Italy: Location, Structure, Function, Meaning

The Italian peninsula offered fertile ground for the development and dissemination of narrative sequences of the Apocalypse during the Romanesque era. At least five monumental sequences have come down to us from the first two centuries of the second millennium: in northern Italy, Novara Baptistery (before 1050), San Pietro al Monte at Civate (1093–1097), and San Severo at Bardolino (before 1150); in Lazio, Sant’Elia at Castel Sant’Elia (1122–1126) and the crypt of Anagni Cathedral (ca. 1104 or 1174–1231). To these we can add two fragmentary Beatus manuscripts of the eleventh century and the Beatus manuscript now in Berlin (ca. 1150?), all originating in or near the Beneventan script zone of Lazio and Campania. While the manuscripts most plausibly were made for monastic use, the wall paintings occur in a wide range of contexts and locations: baptistery, cathedral, monastic church, parish church; cupola, transept, nave, narthex, crypt. This diversity might speak against a synthetic study, but striking similarities in the scenes selected for representation and the termination of all of the mural sequences at or prior to Chapter 12 of the Apocalypse, with the sole exception of one image at Civate, suggest a deeper level of coherence in terms of reading practices and reception of the Apocalypse at a moment of demonstrably renewed local interest in its exegesis, as evidenced, for example, by the writings of Bruno of Segni (ca. 1040–1123).

I am not the first to propose addressing these monuments as a group. Beginning in the 1970s and with a notable acceleration in the years surrounding the turn of the third millennium, such scholars as Peter K. Klein and Yves Christe sought to understand the historical development, European spread, and theological significances of Apocalyptic imagery; the Italian monuments figured, to differing degrees, in their analyses of pictorial recensions and the meanings of individual motifs. More recently, Natasha O’Hear and Richard K. Emmerson have approached Europe’s monumental and manuscript sequences from the perspective of visual exegesis, yet they barely touch upon the Romanesque material, which they find to be too textually faithful to yield much through this method. Moreover, while Christe in particular is very attentive to liturgical contexts and Emmerson to intervisual relationships within manuscripts, as a whole these synthetic studies have not adequately considered the architectural or broader pictorial settings of the sequences. In this paper, rooted in my newly published analysis of the paintings at Castel Sant’Elia (*The Medieval Monastery of Saint Elijah: A History in Paint and Stone*, Turnhout 2021) and informed by recent studies of other individual monuments, I consider the surviving Italian sequences from perspectives of *spazio figurato*, ritual function, and visual and textual exegesis. My goal is threefold: to call attention to the woefully understudied San Severo (and to a lesser extent, Novara, both last investigated in depth more than 40 years ago), to reveal the contextual and intellectual flexibility of narrative representations of St. John’s visions in the Italian peninsula, and to offer some new answers to a deceptively simple question with profound historical and theological ramifications for the Romanesque era: why the Apocalypse?

Rose Walker

Old Testament narrative images in Navarre and Aragón in the mid-twelfth century: sites of theological and social tension?

This paper will focus on two Old Testament narratives from the mid-twelfth century in northern Spain. Both are exceptional survivals and demonstrate high levels of technical expertise. One is found on a double capital that has survived from the lost Romanesque cloister of Pamplona cathedral (Museo de Navarra) and is usually dated to c. 1140. It depicts scenes from the Book of Job: Job and his children; the Destruction of Job's Flock below Job with his wife and three hooded companions; a dramatic Destruction of Job's House; and Job on the Dunghill. Six of the other surviving capitals are foliate, and another two set out scenes from the Passion of Christ and his Entombment and Resurrection. Although often compared to the later series of capitals that also chose to put Job alongside a Passion cycle at La Daurade in Toulouse, David Simon has related the Pamplona carving to the cloister of the cathedral of Notre-Dame-des-Doms in Avignon.

The second object is a fragment from an antiphonary probably executed in the scriptorium of Huesca cathedral (Huesca, Archivo Histórico Provincial 12030/36), usually dated to the second half of the twelfth century. Here, an illuminated initial marks the beginning of the responsory, *Tolle arma tua*. The narrative occupies two registers: in the upper section Isaac is shown lying in his bed, where he wishes to give his blessing to his first-born son, Esau. Below Rebecca is encircled by a dragon as she urges Jacob to deceive his father and obtain the blessing by stealth. This fragment can be seen in relation to the revival of interest in illuminated bibles in the second half of the twelfth century in Iberia more widely.

Although it is improbable that these images are exact contemporaries, they share an interest in Old Testament narratives that are rarely depicted, as well as an imaginative and dramatic approach to that portrayal. They are also both associated with cathedrals that were key in the implementation of reform throughout the century. This paper will address the relationship of these narratives to exegesis. It will examine detailed aspects of the representations, both structural and iconographic. In particular, it will put forward the idea that both narratives were conceived amidst concerns about Judaism and heresy in the local communities. It may be no coincidence that the lateral portal of the north transept at Chartres, sculpted several decades later and seen as a refutation of current heresies, also has a scene of Job on a dunghill accompanied by his wife and three male figures. Paul Williamson interprets Job as the Church suffering and the three male figures as a Jew, a Moslem and a heretic. Navarre and Aragón in the mid-twelfth century had different but related tensions.