



BRITISH ARCHAEOLOGICAL ASSOCIATION

Hildesheim Romanesque Online Conference Abstracts

ROMANESQUE AND THE YEAR 1000

TUESDAY 7 SEPTEMBER - SESSION 1 (GERHARD LUTZ)

Cecily Hennessy

Otto III and the Widow Theophanu: A Greek Court in the West?

The arrival of Theophanu, a young Byzantine aristocrat, in 972 to marry Otto II in Rome has given rise to extensive differing views on her influence on the court of the western Holy Roman Empire. These have centred on whether the objects, the artists and the courtiers she may have brought with her had any significant impact on the art and architecture of the court and beyond. Underlying these discussions is the idea that the prestige, skill of production, opulence, iconography and 'Byzantine' style of art of the east was highly valued.

This paper looks ten years on to the period following Theophanu's widowhood in 983 when she became regent for her fourth child and only son, Otto III, who was then three years old. It argues that she looked to her Greek heritage in the education and cultural nurturing of her children before her death in 991 when Otto was eleven. Taking a fresh look at the legacy of Theophanu's role as a widowed Greek mother, it questions how far this eastern emphasis in her children's education in turn influenced the function and production of art in the period up to Otto's death in 1002. To what extent can one view their patronage in terms of Byzantine imperial behaviour and education? How far did they meet the probable expectations of creating and projecting a powerful imperial model based on eastern precepts?

In the east, imperial children were educated in Byzantine political theory and practice and given an understanding of the religious mysticism associated with the emperor, who was at the centre of a cultic form of worship. Imperial power was manifest in the rituals of the court with their dress and insignia. Otto was brought up in a version of this culture with, among others, a tutor of Greek heritage, John Philagathos, who was his mother's chaplain.

This paper explores the following questions: To what extent did the patronage of Theophanu, Otto and their entourage promote or intend to promote a reflection of the court culture and arts of imperial Byzantium? What evidence do we have of how they recreated the practices and appearance of what was commonly viewed as a wealthy, resplendent and exotic eastern court? To what degree did they endeavour to and succeed in reframing

the Ottonian court? How might one evaluate the impact of the books, ivories, metal work and regalia produced in this crucial period of transformation at the turn of the millennium.

Barbara Franzé

Images and society in Reichenau c. 1000

The present church of St. George of Oberzell, located on the island of Reichenau, is largely the work of Abbot Hatto (888-913): according to historical sources confirmed by dendrochronological analyses, it was built shortly before or shortly after the acquisition of the relics of the patron saint, in 896. The western apse, which is dendro-dated to between 925 and 945, and the porch that precedes it, therefore, belong to a later phase of construction.

On the other hand, the dating of the painted decoration on the walls of the crypt and nave is less consensual. Given their similarities to illuminations produced in the scriptorium at Reichenau (Evangelary of Otto III and the *Codex Egberti*), most art historians date the nave paintings to around the year 1000, the time of the Abbot builder Witigowo (985-996); others consider that the paintings, in a Carolingian style, are contemporary with the construction and therefore date to the abbacy of Hatto. A date cannot be demonstrated from the written sources, however, as these are not explicit on the subject, nor does stylistic analysis offer a secure guide to their chronology, as the decoration is too degraded. Instead, intend to analyse the iconographic programme, an underexplored aspect of the paintings, and search for the meaning of images in relation to the exegetical tradition of the Middle Ages.

Unlike what can be observed elsewhere (Müstair, Sant'Angelo in Formis), the cycle at Oberzell begins at the west end of the north wall and returns via the south – as at Goldbach, whose paintings are stylistically and iconographically related to Oberzell. The episodes are dedicated to the miracles of Christ, subjects commented on at length by Carolingian exegetes, who offer a remarkably consistent reading of their meaning and importance. The miracles of Christ represented on the north wall thus participate in a discourse on the Church and on the institution of the sacrament of baptism as an initial act of the journey towards salvation. The episodes chosen to decorate the south wall are part of a corpus of motifs, gathered by medieval theologians to demonstrate the need for penance and the mediation of the church in order to obtain salvation.

By strongly emphasizing the role of the priesthood in the economy of salvation, the iconographic programme reflects a vision of society common to 10th-century reformers, as defined, for example, in the *Apologeticus* of Abbon of Fleury (c. 994) and the Canonical Collection he assembled to obtain exemptions for his abbey (991-993/993-997). In Reichenau, the reform was introduced by Alawic II (997-1000): in 997, in Rome, Pope Gregory V confirmed Alawic's election and took the abbey under his protection. The privileges obtained were immediately confirmed by Emperor Otto III. In Rome, Alawic had the opportunity to meet Abbo de Fleury, who had been sent to the Pontifical Court by Hugues Capet and came to plead the cause of his abbey.

The social vision proposed by the paintings of St. George at Oberzell is in line with that reflected in the illuminations of the Glosses on the Song of Songs and Book of Daniel (Bamberg: Staatsbibliothek MS 22) painted in Reichenau around the year 1000. There, the image of Daniel interpreting Nebuchadnezzar's dream, and that of *Ecclesia* heading towards salvation, designate the church, and the monks, in particular, as intercessors with God and intermediaries between him and the earthly sovereign. The manuscript thus confirms a dating of the paintings at Oberzell to around the year 1000, during the time of Alawic, when the reform was introduced to Reichenau.

Jesús Rodríguez Viejo

Authorship, cult, and monastic reform in Ottonian St Gall: The decoration of the Hartker Antiphonary

The Abbey of St Gall was sacked by the Magyars in 926, putting an end to the community's so-called Carolingian 'Golden Age' of institutional power and cultural excellence. In 937, the abbey complex was

largely destroyed by a fire. The scriptorium of St Gall virtually ceased to manufacture manuscripts during those decades, experiencing a revival only in the 970s.

The Hartker Antiphonary (St. Gallen, Stiftsbibliothek, Codices Sangallenses 390 and 391) is the largest and most lavishly decorated manuscript to date from the period of communal re-discovery, opportunity, and social conflict that the Alpine abbey experienced around the year 1000. The peculiar *artifex* behind the creation of this liturgical tool for the community's Divine Office was Hartker (d. 1011), a local hermit somehow attached to St Gall and today considered the author of some of the oldest and most accurate examples of neumatic notation in Gregorian chant.

Besides this element of authorship, the manuscript displays a set of full-page scenes, some exhibiting unique iconographic elements. The donation scene to the abbey's founder, the Irish pilgrim St Gallus, an enigmatic inscription, a Last Supper without a chalice, or the all-pervading presence of large curtains in most scenes, indicate a carefully designed pictorial programme that is likely to have had an important symbolism for the monastic audiences that conceptualised it.

The aim of this paper is to present the peculiarities of the Hartker Antiphonary's decoration, an overlooked manuscript in a period of St Gall's history largely forgotten by specialists, especially art historians. Combining local historical sources, liturgy, and images, this presentation intends to shed light on the complex socio-religious circumstances that witnessed the manuscript's creation at St Gall around the year 1000.

TUESDAY 7 SEPTEMBER - SESSION 2 (RICHARD PLANT)

Marcello Angeben

The Representation of the Old Testament God in Anglo-Saxon manuscripts

Since the 4th century, mural paintings and manuscripts have depicted the opening chapters of Genesis with a 'Christomorphic' God, probably because God created the world with the Word and Christ is the incarnated *Logos*. In illustrated Bibles from Tours, this character is called Christ, confirming that he is the Word of God. When Adam and Eve are expelled from heaven, this figure disappears and is substituted by a *chirophany*, the hand of God emerging from the sky. This latter tradition lives into the early 11th century as, for example, on the Hildesheim doors. A crucial change happens at this same moment in two Anglo-Saxon manuscripts where God is generally depicted in christomorphic guise: the so-called 'Junius Manuscript' and the 'Old English Hexateuch'. This trend then develops into the second half of the 11th century, as in the two surviving Bibles from Ripoll and the vault paintings at Saint-Savin-sur-Gartempe.

This new iconography suggests that around the year 1000, Anglo-Saxon clergy wanted to bring the faithful and themselves closer to God by bringing him closer to men, in other words by making him more human. This is confirmed by an examination of three iconographic themes and their textual roots: the vision of God at the moment of the particular judgment, the sufferings of Christ on the cross and the anthropomorphic representation of the Father within the Trinity. These themes anticipate in many respects the new religious sentiments that developed in the eleventh century which were confirmed in the prayers of Anselm of Canterbury, especially empathy for the Crucified God and his Mother. At the same time, there are several clues which suggest that this humanisation of God is closely related to the need to visualize him in the context of devotion.

Sophie Kelly

Trinity and Transformation at the Turn of the Millennium

The three decades to either side of the millennium saw remarkable transformations in Trinitarian iconography and doctrine. The ‘Great Schism’ between the Eastern and Western churches, culminating in the mutual excommunications of Cardinal Humbert and Patriarch Michael Cerularius in 1054, was fuelled by increasing tensions between Eastern and Western approaches to the Trinity over the course of the later tenth and early eleventh centuries. These tensions were exacerbated by interventions by the Holy Roman Emperors Otto I and Henry II, who increasingly sought control over the Pope and the structure of the liturgy; it was at Henry II’s request, for example, that the *filioque* clause, championing the procession of the Holy Spirit from both the Father and the Son, was first integrated into the Roman Creed on February 14 1014, outraging Eastern church officials.

Artists working amidst these tensions would likely have known the relatively controversial nature of their subject matter, yet images of the Trinity from this period are among some of the most inventive and unusual of the Middle Ages. Engaging specifically with Trinitarian images made in the Western tradition, this paper will examine how artists working around the year 1000 found new ways to express the three-in-one nature of God and uphold the Western principles of the *filioque*. Whilst earlier expressions of the Trinitarian God had on the whole favoured a depiction of the singular enthroned figure ‘Deus’, the last decades of the tenth century saw a shift towards the visualisation of all three persons in their individual forms. Some images, such as a painted initial in a late tenth-century copy of Boethius’ *De Trinitate* from Fleury Abbey, retained the image of the enthroned God but added representations of the Son, as either lamb or man, and the dove of the Holy Spirit, thus transforming the image of the enthroned figure into that of the Father. Others, such as the magnificent engraving on the reverse of the Cross of Lothar, made around the year 1000, situate Christ as the principle subject of the image, with the Father’s presence indicated by the *Manus Dei* and the Spirit again in the form of a dove. These same two attributes also appear in images of Christ’s baptism across a multitude of media, from manuscript illumination to ivories and metalwork.

In introducing the representations of the second and third persons of the Trinity, these new artistic formulas reflected the wider Western theological move away from the prominence of God the Father in the Trinitarian hierarchy. Equipped with the visual language to depict all three persons of the Godhead, Romanesque artists increasingly found new ways to explore the ramifications of the *filioque* clause and, notably, emphasise the relationship between the Father and Son. This paper will also show how images of the Trinity made around the year 1000 paved the way for Trinitarian images in the later eleventh and twelfth centuries, which drew heavily on these Romanesque precedents.

Shirin Fozi

Unpacking the Ottonian Sarcophagus 968-1022

Scholarly attention to the medieval sarcophagus has been uneven, at best, in recent years. Some examples are quite well-known; others have been overlooked and remain unfamiliar even among specialists. This paper will focus on Ottonian sarcophagi from the decades around the year 1000, taking the best-known specimens from this period as a point of departure and situating them in a broad visual and historical context. The purpose is not merely to trace the ‘development’ or the ‘history’ of these evocative objects, but rather to arrive at a stronger understanding of funerary culture and the commemoration of bodies at the turn of the first millennium in northern Europe.

The proposed time frame reflects the prominence of two unusual cases. The first is the pair of sarcophagi made *ca.* 968 for Queen Mathilda at Quedlinburg and Bishop Bernward of Halberstadt, both of whom died that year. As Ernst Schubert has pointed out, the lids of these ‘twin’ sarcophagi are so similar that their striking resonance seems to have been intended. This connection is made all the more compelling thanks to a

miracle story recounted by Thietmar of Merseburg (ca. 1012-1018). As Schubert argued, the similarity of their forms may have been connected to political tensions that existed between the convent and the cathedral. The second case, which provides an end date for the present discussion, is the sarcophagus of Bernward of Hildesheim from c. 1022. As Tobias Frese and others have noted, the Bernward sarcophagus is unusual in its complexity, and its haunting use of a quote from the Book of Job seems linked to image-text relationships that can be observed elsewhere in Hildesheim.

The category of the Ottonian sarcophagus from 'c. 1000' is thus conveniently framed by significant examples that have been carefully studied in recent years. What remains to be considered, however, is a larger relationship between these monuments and other, more 'typical' sarcophagi that survive from the same era. Most of the other known sarcophagi from the period ca. 960-1030 are strikingly simple, marked with neither image nor text. A broad census of such sarcophagi has yet to be established, however, and it is difficult to understand the 'exceptional' cases if we lack a clear view of the patterns that constitute the genre as a whole. Furthermore, the existing studies of the Quedlinburg, Halberstadt, and Hildesheim sarcophagi would be enriched by a broader consideration of early medieval epitaphs in other formats, taking both surviving plaques and memorials known only through written descriptions into account. Finally, all of these objects need to be situated more clearly in the artistic and liturgical practices of their time, and the transformations of visual culture that are loosely associated with the rise of Romanesque sculpture. The goal of this paper, therefore, is to reconsider the form and meaning of Ottonian sarcophagi, towards an account of funerary monuments that puts the richest and the humblest examples in dialogue with each other.

WEDNESDAY 8 SEPTEMBER – SESSION 3 (ALEXANDRA GAJEWSKI)

Lindy Grant

Transforming the kingdom: Artistic patronage and the establishment of Early Capetian kingship in France.

The early Capetian kings of France were usurpers – nobles who in 987 had grabbed the French crown from the Carolingian dynasty, the dynasty descended from the Emperor Charlemagne. How did they impose themselves as kings? How did they establish themselves as worthy successors to the dynasty of Charles the Great? How did they distance themselves from their fellow great princes? How did they manage to cling on to the throne? Historians have tended to give the early Capetians short shrift, suggesting that they clung to power more through luck than by judgement.

This paper will argue that Hugh Capet (ruled 987-996), and, in particular, Robert II, the Pious (ruled 996-1031), made far more extensive use of material culture and a programme of building to provide themselves with an image of prestigious kingship. They revived the relationship between the kings and Saint-Denis, contributing to the collection of royal regalia there, and establishing it as the royal burial house. Robert toyed with representing himself with an orb on his seal – though that signifier of world 'imperium' was dropped by subsequent kings. Robert instituted a programme of rebuilding at several royal palaces, and commissioned or encouraged new building in religious houses with royal connections. The lists of Robert's gifts of liturgical objects and books to religious houses, together with Ralph Glaber's account of his meeting with the Emperor Henry II in 1023, reveal the extent to which Robert had access to resources of gold and jewels and to skilled workers in gold and ivory. This paper will thus explore a hitherto ignored aspect of Capetian kingship, and suggest that the kings, queens and their entourages played a far more important role in the cultural and artistic transformations in France around the year 1000 than is usually appreciated.

Éliane Vergnolle

A monarch and his buildings: The case of Robert the Pious (996-1031)

Helgaud, the biographer of Robert the Pious described his subject as a great builder. Few of the churches that Helgaud tells us were erected by the king have survived, and many were incomplete. However, recent and continuing research at Orléans (both the cathedral and Saint-Aignan), as well as at Saint-Germain-des-Prés in Paris, Étampes and Melun provide a better appreciation of the importance of his patronage.

It is above all architectural diversity which is most evident: an apse-ambulatory and radiating chapels in the two churches in Orléans, a ‘harmonic’ apse at Notre-Dame de Melun and perhaps Saint-Germain-des-Près. Most tellingly, all the churches share a particular feature, namely the use of *pierre de taille* or ashlar masonry, a masonry technique that emerged at the start of the 11th century in the most prestigious buildings of Western Francia. The adoption of composite piers and figural capitals in the nave of Saint-Germain-des-Prés at the same period is no less remarkable. These figural and historiated capitals from the 1020s are comparable to those of the tower porch at Saint-Benoît-sur-Loire, which Gauzlin, a half-brother of King Robert the Pious, erected around 1020. Taken as a whole the survivals provide further evidence that the tastes, interests and prestige of the Capetian king may have had a considerable impact on the birth of early Romanesque art and architecture.

Claude Andrault-Schmitt

The Birth of Romanesque Architecture in Aquitaine in the Light of the Patronage of Duke William the Great (993-1030)

Aquitaine is surrounded by regions which are celebrated for their early Romanesque buildings. For instance, in Anjou and Touraine, recent investigations have dated several important churches to the last years of the 10th century. Thus, we can get the impression that the dioceses of Poitiers, Limoges, Angoulême and Saintes represent a sort of wilderness.

However, the political, economic and religious context in Aquitaine was propitious for architectural patronage. A number of documented events are recorded – such as foundations, consecrations and translations of relics (Valérie at Chambon in 985, Radegonde at Poitiers in 1012, John the Baptist at St Jean d’Angely in 1016...). None of these documentary milestones are matched by real stones.

William the Great (993-1030), whose grandfather had adopted the title Duke of Aquitaine, created a virtuous network of wise abbots and bishops belonging to his *familia*. He promoted church councils and adopted spiritual patrons who gave him legitimacy, saints such as Martial, Maixent, Junien, and Hilaire. He strengthened the established family abbey of Maillezais in the western marshes, a site which he symbolically made over to St Peter’s in Rome, and where he died, having retreated there towards the end of his life. One of his methods he used to promote monastic life in the Poitou was to write to famous abbots to obtain teams of monks. Thus, monks were sent from St-Savin-sur-Gartempe to Charroux, from Uzerche to Limoges; from St-Benoît-sur-Loire to Nouaillé-Maupertuis. William the Great’s penitential attitude and personal devotion were enhanced by donations and reforms. The material consequences of his patronage are sometimes difficult to comprehend, but we can observe meaningful urban upheavals within his two capitals, Poitiers and Limoges.

Concerning Romanesque architecture *stricto sensu*, Limoges introduces the question of the modernity of the ambulatory with radiating chapels. However, the recently excavated eastern part of St Martial (1018-1028) is not the only representative of the type. The chevets of St-Etienne in Limoges, Uzerche, and St-Savin deserve to be highlighted. Some towers dating to the first quarter of the 11th century also survive in elevation. Their most distinctive characteristic is to have been built as freestanding structures, as with St Hilaire-le-Grand in Poitiers and Evaux as well as at Brantôme or Maillezais. How were the naves of larger churches of this date treated? Some evidence suggests they were wide, with thin walls linked by transverse arches. Thus, it may be

that of the churches built in Aquitaine in the years around 1000, ambulatories and towers represent the future, while their naves continued to look to the Carolingian past.

Finally, to complete the scene, we should mention *spolia*. A lot of capitals, lintels, inscriptions dating from the early 11th century were redeployed in the late 11th and early 12th century, evidence which leads us to regret the ruin or replacement of William the Great's buildings.

WEDNESDAY 8 SEPTEMBER – SESSION 4 (UTE ENGEL)

Wilfried E. Keil

Willigis and his Cathedral – The Building of a new Coronation Church by the Archchancellor and Archbishop of Mainz

Willigis (940-1011), who was described by contemporaries as “father of the Emperor and the Empire”, was appointed chancellor by Emperor Otto I in 971 and Archbishop of Mainz by Emperor Otto II in 975. This was when the Archchancellorship first became linked with the Archbishop of Mainz, which continued throughout the Middle Ages. As Archbishop of Mainz Willigis enjoyed primacy over all other bishops in church matters, in the granting of the royal dignity, and the synodal chairmanship by Pope Benedict VII, which effectively made him second only to the Pope. In addition, he obtained the right to wear the pallium, otherwise reserved for the Pope. After the death of Otto II in Italy in 983, his three-year-old son was crowned Otto III by Willigis in Aachen. Initially, Empress Theophanu assumed control of imperial affairs, and after her death in 991 Willigis acted alone until 994, when Otto III was declared mature. Willigis' power was sufficient to defend Otto III against the counter-king Henry the Wrangler, who was crowned in Quedlinburg in 984. After the death of Otto III in 1002 Henry II was crowned king in Mainz by Archbishop Willigis. Why in Mainz and not in Aachen? Because of disputes between Archbishop Willigis and Emperor Otto III in 998, the Pope ruled that Willigis was no longer allowed to hold masses in the coronation church in Aachen.

This was probably why Willigis built and furnished Mainz cathedral in such a way that it could be a coronation church. It is verifiable that Willigis travelled regularly to Italy in his role as Archchancellor and Archbishop. In this paper I will show how Willigis' cathedral refers to Old St Peter's (orientation to the west; western transept; its proportions; atrium in the east; etc.). Willigis seems to have planned Mainz as royal city, a Rome of the North. The furnishings also legitimized it as coronation church. The removable Benna-cross made of black cypress with gold fittings was set up for special occasions at the cross altar. Its appearance can be reconstructed by descriptions and compared with the surviving crosses of Pavia and Vercelli. The cathedral's cast bronze doors were inspired by antique doors in Italy and those in Aachen. In an inscription on the doors Willigis emphasises that he was the first after Charlemagne who had made such doors. In 1009 the completed cathedral burned down on the night of its consecration. Bishop Willigis immediately began new construction works. Shortly thereafter, in 1010 Bishop Bernward began the construction of St Michel in Hildesheim, emulating and competing with Willigis.

In the paper I will explore a complex web of ideological, iconographical and geographical references that has yet to be satisfactorily investigated. There were not only references to Rome as the place of the imperial coronation and Aachen as the place of the king's coronation, but also to other references in the Empire, and to Byzantium and Jerusalem. Finally, the impact of Willigis on Bernward's artistic patronage, still not adequately researched, will be briefly shown.

Tobias Schoo

The Domburg and the Market Town of Halberstadt around the Year 1000

The decades around the year 1000 AD are of crucial importance for the urban development of the bishop's see at Halberstadt (Harz county), originally founded in the first half of the ninth century. During this period, important building projects were realized that shaped the townscape, such as the new cathedral (consecrated in 992) and the church of our Lady (begun in 1005) in the western part of the Domburg. In addition to these building projects, a series of royal decrees issued in 989 - the right to hold markets, to mint and issue coinage, and the right to levy tariffs - laid the foundations for economic advancement.

Questions concerning the shape and the characteristics of the two nuclei that later developed into the town of Halberstadt – the Domburg (cathedral castle) and the market town – in the decades around 1000 can also be addressed through archaeological analysis. Material from several dozen archaeological excavations distributed across the entire area of both settlement sites, some of them large-scale excavations, is available to give insight into the appearance of the bishop's see of this period.

Interesting in this context in addition to the fortifications of the Domburg are the castle's religious, sepulchral, and secular buildings. Hence, the question of a possible stone fortification wall in Halberstadt must be investigated. Furthermore, references to a rapid process in the settlement formation of the market town assumed in earlier archaeological research are to be re-evaluated.

In my presentation I aim to present aspects of my current dissertation, under the direction of the chair of Medieval and Early Modern archaeology at Martin-Luther-University Halle-Wittenberg. For this purpose, the excavations conducted since the early 1950s will be linked to the results of the recent and as yet unpublished excavations dating from after 1990 to approximate a picture of the town of Halberstadt around the year 1000.

Bruno Klein

Saint Michael at Hildesheim as a Magic Machine (lecture on site)

The Church of St. Michael in Hildesheim was built in the early eleventh century and is one of the canonical cornerstones in the history of medieval architecture. The building, with its outstanding concept, lay at the centre of a Benedictine monastery founded by Bishop Bernward (993-1022) around 1015 as his burial place. This paper will depart from established scholarship by concentrating on the church in its role as the stage for a complex arrangement of liturgical performances. At the centre of these performances were, naturally, masses and liturgical offices, all of which conceptually and spatially referenced Bernward's tomb in the crypt.

Bernward expanded the standard performative act of transubstantiation regularly performed at the altar in the mass, by adding two permanent magical elements to the church. Besides the mandatory placement of holy relics in the altar, additional relics, accompanied by inscriptions, were placed above the columns in the nave of the church, enhancing the building with emissions of "magical" substances beyond the transcendence effected by its consecration. The second element was his tomb. Bernward had his grave made like the tomb of a saint, which prompts one to think that it was his intention from the beginning to promote his own canonization with the foundation of St. Michael's, along with his numerous donations. This finally happened in 1192.

Thus, the Church of St. Michael was a monument which contained, on the one hand, magical elements from the moment of its construction, through holy relics inserted into the building; and on the other hand it contained additional magical potential through the presumed canonization of the builder – something that was expected from the outset of the project. That is why we can call the building a magic machine.

The final part of this paper will not only look at how this machine functioned until the magic ended with the 16th-century Reformation, but also whether Bernward's approach can be compared with contemporary architecture and thinking around the year 1000.

THURSDAY 9 SEPTEMBER – SESSION 5 (MANUEL CASTIÑEIRAS)

Hugh Doherty

Bernard of Angers at Aurillac: Viewing the saints and their treasures at the turn of millennium

Bernard of Angers is famous as the author of one of the most remarkable texts to survive from the medieval west: the *Liber miraculorum sancte Fidis*. His work constitutes vivid and moving testimony to his relationship with the martyr and saint, St Foy of Conques—'his special patron' and 'my invincible champion', as he describes her. His text also offers an unparalleled commentary on contemporary reflections on the function and design of church fabric and furnishings at the beginning of the eleventh century. Yet close examination of his 'little codex' (*libellus*) reveals that the formation and development of Bernard's own responses to the fabric and furnishings of Conques were rather more complex than he himself was willing to concede.

A significant stage in this process—as this paper will demonstrate—was his pilgrimage to the shrine of St Gerald at Aurillac in 1013. Only when the importance of this event is recognised can his own views on the cult of relics and the making of reliquaries be fully understood. This paper, engaging primarily with the testimony of his *libellus*, but also utilising documentary and material evidence from other corners of early eleventh-century Francia, will seek to demonstrate two important points. The first is that Bernard recognised that his own time was somehow different to what had gone before—not, however, in relation to the passing of the millennium and the expected arrival of the Antichrist, but because of the renewed presence and power of St Foy at Conques and her surrounding territory. The second point is that Bernard undertook the composition of his text as a response to—indeed as a solution for—the challenging circumstances of his time. In many ways, as this paper will contend, his *libellus* underlines the emergence of a new discourse between image and text at the beginning of the second millennium. Moved and impressed by what he had seen and experienced and learnt at Conques, Bernard sought to communicate the power of her physical celebration on earth through the composition of his *libellus* and through its circulation in northern Frankish circles.

Florian Meunier

Precious book covers: Gold and Ivory between a Carolingian heritage and New Patterns

Ivory carving and the art of the goldsmith were often combined in the Carolingian period to create precious covers as book-bindings for liturgical manuscripts which were used during the Mass. These were kept in the treasuries of abbeys and cathedrals.

The question we wish to explore is how we should define the differences between Carolingian and Ottonian production in these technical and artistic fields. Precious book covers – or elements coming from them – especially those today preserved in Paris (Louvre and Bibliothèque nationale de France) and originally from Saint-Denis, Maastricht and Metz – might offer some clues.

From a stylistic point of view, Ottonian book covers are substantially different to those made under the Carolingians. But are there also significant technical differences (in the use of enamels for example), and in the evidence for the reuse of ancient works of art? A study of book covers leads to the question of how Romanesque art perhaps distinguished itself from Early medieval Art in the context of church treasures.

Jordi Camps i Sòria

Sculpture in Catalonia Around the Year 1000: The 'Corinthian' Capitals in Ripoll

Sculpture around the year 1000 in Catalonia is marked by trends represented on the one hand by the reliefs in Saint-Génis-des-Fontaines (1019-1020) and Saint-André de Sorède, and the decoration in Sant Pere de Rodes; on the other by a series of capitals derived from Corinthian types in major centres such as Ripoll and Vic. This is not the place to talk about the issue of the initial function of some of these works, which has been the subject of many studies by art historians. Instead, my intention is to focus on the case of Ripoll. Current opinion holds that one of the aspects that must have marked the decoration of the abbey church of Santa Maria at Ripoll around the year 1000 were the Corinthian capitals that, supposedly, would have formed part of the support elements for the church. Few have survived, recovered during the restoration work on the monument in the second half of the nineteenth century, and many of these are in a damaged or fragmentary state. Moreover, they are of different architectural compositions and sizes, so it is difficult to establish where they might have originally been sited. One of them was reused in the upper gallery of the cloister in the Gothic period. The capitals of Ripoll are part of a group that includes elements supporting the crypt at Vic Cathedral, several reused examples in the cloister of the monastery of Sant Benet de Bages, as well as others from that particular area, such as those in the bell tower of Sant Mateu de Bages. We should also consider two more capitals in the parish church of Santa Maria in Cornellà de Llobregat, near Barcelona.

The first author who attempted to study and classify the group was Félix Hernández, who emphasized their similarity to Andalusian sculpture in the period of the caliphate, with reference points in the mosque in Córdoba. Subsequently, authors such as Puig i Cadafalch, Georges Gaillard, Eduard Junyent have tackled the subject, but up to now there has been no detailed comparative study made of all the works. Some historians have dated the majority of these examples to somewhere in the first third of the eleventh century, on the basis of their attribution to the period of Abbot and Bishop Oliba (off. 1008-46). One must bear in mind that some pieces in Sant Miquel de Cuixà have also been associated with the baldachin built by Oliba, described in the well-known sermon by the monk Garsias. Other authors, however, would place these works in the last decades of the tenth century, using as a starting point the consecrations of some of the corresponding buildings in those years. At the same time, the different groups constitute an eloquent example of the survival and reinterpretation of ancient points of reference, which, with differences in intensity and quality with respect to other parts of Europe and the Mediterranean, was also evident in Late Antiquity (Sant Miquel at Terrassa, for example).

Apart from the problematic classification of the series, one must also bear in mind a new element. Among the remains of supposedly early medieval capitals, one fragment has hitherto gone unnoticed; normally exhibited upside down, it presents clear traces of acanthus leaves and may be considered Roman, probably late Roman. The presence of this piece at Ripoll opens up a suggestive hypothesis about the existence of ancient carved elements, which might have served as a benchmark of prestige. The appearance of such a fragment is in line with the interest evident at Ripoll of the recovery of ancient culture, as reflected in the production of its scriptorium and in the contents of its library. In addition, we must not forget the existence of vestiges of Late Antiquity in the necropolis excavated under the transept of the Romanesque church.

The intention of the paper is to review this group of capitals and their links with al-Andalus against the backdrop of the past. I also intend to stress the presence of the piece from Antiquity as a novelty, in this way reinforcing the importance of Rome in the culture and artistic life of Ripoll around the year 1000.

THURSDAY 9 SEPTEMBER – SESSION 6 (CECILY HENNESSY)

Rose Walker

Order and disorder through the eyes of scribes and illuminators in the kingdom of Pamplona c. 970 – c. 1000

This paper will examine order and disorder in manuscripts from the kingdom of Pamplona executed between c. 970 and c. 1000. Both Neo-Visigothic content and proto-Romanesque style can be found in these books, a contrast that reflects the tensions of those decades and the geographic location of the kingdom. Distant marriage ties linked Pamplona (very roughly contiguous with modern Navarre and La Rioja) eastwards to Ribagorza, westwards to Castile and León, and northwards, across the Pyrenees, to Gascony. The aggressive campaigns of al-Mansur, hajib or chamberlain of Córdoba tested Pamplona's previous negotiated relationship with al-Andalus, but even so in 983 Sancho Garcés II (970-994) gave his daughter in marriage to al-Mansur as part of attempts to re-establish peace.

Although architectural achievements were limited at this period, scribes and illuminators built on the innovations of their illustrious predecessors in León and Castile, including Maius at Tábara and Florentius at Valeránica, to create some remarkable books. These include legal and historical manuscripts: the *Codex Vigilanus* (Patrimonio nacional, Biblioteca de El Escorial Cod. d.I.2) of 976 and the *Codex Aemilianensis* (Patrimonio nacional, Biblioteca de El Escorial Cod. d.II) of c. 994, as well as liturgical and exegetical codices, including two copies of the Commentary on the Apocalypse by Beatus (the unfinished Real Academia de la Historia, Cod. 33 and Patrimonio nacional, Biblioteca de El Escorial (&.II.5) both of c. 1000. Accomplished artists now worked at the monasteries of San Martín de Albelda and San Millán de la Cogolla, and the styles of their illumination varied from a highly abstract version of 'Mozarabic' art to attempts at plasticity that have been called proto-Romanesque.

I shall analyse the way that these books impose order in a febrile political environment through the creation of a Neo-Visigothic identity and the visual codification of knowledge (*scientia*). At the core of this will be the expression of the natural order – albeit still in an ecclesiastical context – in the form of maps, *rotae* and the depiction of the human body. In contrast, transgressions of that order are found in representations of hybrid creatures in illuminated initials and frames. Disorder likewise forms the essential content of the Escorial Beatus, but its singular portrayal of the end of time works within a clear archetype. Together all these facets will demonstrate that the manuscripts embody a protean period of transformation in the art of Iberia that sought order through recording and copying but was at the same time open to disruptive new approaches.

Elizabeth Valdez del Álamo

After al-Mansur: Art in Castile 970-1030

The County of Castile was the product of a rebellion by Count Fernán González (r. 931-970) against the Kingdom of León. While the county remained subject to León in name, it achieved virtual autonomy, with the title of Count now hereditary instead of existing as a position controlled and appointed by the Leonese king. This paper examines Castilian art produced during the reigns of Fernán González's heirs, who battled al-Mansur beginning c. 980, and who repopulated the county after the raids ended in 1002. Because Castile gave shelter to a runaway son of the Cordoban general in 990, the county was subjected to frequent devastating attacks by his army. The years c. 970-1030 make an interesting study for the region because during this period Castile was relatively isolated from the rest of Europe.

Sites from this epoch in Castile can be found in Burgos, and many are associated with the counts: Cardeña, Covarrubias, Arlanza, Retortillo, and Barriosuso. Sculptural fragments bear witness to additional structures. San Baudelio de Berlanga in Soria, traditionally counted as a building from this epoch, is now dated later but merits discussion as regards its shifting place in the eleventh-century repertory.

San Millán de la Cogolla, governed by Castilian and Navarrese overlords and attacked by al-Mansur, crowns the achievements of this period. The rupestrine hermitage turned monastery housed a scriptorium producing two *Beatus* manuscripts, the first written words in Castilian, and the *Codex Aemilianensis* with an image of the contemporary Navarrese ruler. Finally, the ivory cross of San Millán suggests an ivory atelier there as well.

The terminology applied to the art of this era is varied. Although the art of Christian Spain during this period is usually described as *Mozarabic*, the term is properly applied only to art produced by Christians from Islamic al-Andalus. Such is not the case for much of the art produced in Castile which some label *Art of the Repopulation*, Late Antique survivals, or one predecessor of Romanesque. While the architecture is often excluded from Romanesque studies, the manuscripts and ivory carvings inspired the Romanesque carvers who later worked in Spain and north of the Pyrenees.

FRIDAY 10 SEPTEMBER – SESSION 7 (ZOË OPACIČ)

Tomasz Weclawowicz

The Imitation of The Empire in Early Medieval Poland

This paper will analyse the reception of Imperial Ottonian models by the rulers of the Polish Kingdom in their court's culture and consider how these shaped architectural forms and urban space. The imperial idea was at its most influential at the beginning of the 11th century. The reason was the close relationship formed between the Polish Kingdom and the Ottonian Empire in the year 1000 when Emperor Otto III organized an episcopal synod in Gniezno to establish an archbishopric. This guaranteed the political independence of the Polish Kingdom. The Emperor awarded the title 'Imperial Friend' to the Polish Prince, Boleslaw the Brave, sealing the relationship by placing the imperial crown on the Prince's head and presenting him with a replica of the Holy Lance.

Following the ceremonies, the Emperor took Prince Boleslaw to Aachen, to witness the opening of Charlemagne's tomb and to take part in the foundation of so-called border churches around Charlemagne's palatine chapel of the Virgin. These were dedicated to the Holy Saviour, St. Nicholas, and St Adalbert. These famous events were recorded by Thietmar, archbishop of Merseburg, and by the French chronicler Adhemar de Chabannes, who was probably in Aachen at the time. Some years later, Boleslaw's son, Mescio II (baptismal name Lambert, born 990), married the Emperor's niece Richeza (later the Blessed Richeza of Lotharingia). The couple then jointly ruled the Krakow province of the Polish Kingdom, where the ruler's residence was established on the Wawel hill at the centre of Krakow. Since the year 1000, Krakow was also the seat of a bishop, and some ten churches and chapels were built there. The palace chapel of the Virgin Mary occupied the principal location. Below the castle hill, along the main trade routes, four border churches were built, with the church of Holy Saviour to the West, St Adalbert to the North, and St Nicholas to the East.

By the 1980s, scholars began to take note of the correspondences between the configuration of three of these churches and Aachen's 'holy topography'. The two cities not only had churches dedicated to the same saints, but their grouping seems to have been designed on the same principles. Moreover, in both cities the church of St Adalbert served the diocesan clergy, while the church of the Holy Saviour and St Nicholas had monastic functions. The similarities in dedication and topography are striking.

In view of this it may be argued that the founder of the Krakow churches wished to highlight the 'imperial beginning' of his dynasty, as well as securing the protection of imperial patron saints over his capital city. Despite some chronological uncertainties some historians (including the speaker), have suggested that the idea for this very specific configuration of the sacral space of the city of Krakow came from the Prince Mescio II, aforementioned husband of the Emperor's niece, Richeza. It is also important to point out that this princely couple baptised their only son (born in 1016) with the name *Carolus*, to emphasize the relationship between

the young Piast dynasty and the rulers of the Holy Roman Empire. The links legitimise the hypothesis that in his capital city the Polish prince intended to re-create the layout of the imperial seat in Aachen.

The idea of an *imitatio Aquisgrani* in Krakow is not the only significant example. Since the middle of the 20th century, complexes of rulers' seats in Poznan, Lednica, Giecz (Greater Poland) and in Przemysl and Wislica (Lesser Poland) have been excavated. Their forms are unique: chapels, are mostly circular in plan adjacent to palaces of a rectangular plan. They mirror the configurations and plans of the Ottonian residences known from archaeological research such as Bamberg, Werla, Xanten and Zurich.

All the aforementioned chapels of Polish rulers are dedicated to the Virgin Mary. At the time, this was rather rare *patrocinium* in Central Europe. Therefore, some scholars suggested that this dedication was adopted because the first Polish Christian prince Mescio I (died 992) received Marian holy relics from Magdeburg (*Partenopolis*), through the hand of the Empress Theophanu, Otto III's mother.

The most interesting aspect of this architectural *imitatio* is that the Ottonian schemes were repeatedly constructed for over a hundred years. The latest was a residential complex in Wislica, not far from Krakow, built in the middle of the 12th century. So, Ottonian, pre-Romanesque architecture deploying simplified forms and austere details continued in the Polish lands as a remembrance of the 'golden age of the Imperial beginning', notwithstanding contemporary stylistic fashions.

Agata Gomólka

When gold was silver and silver was straw: the treasure of saints and warriors in Poland c. 1000

On 22 August 1039 the citizens of Prague witnessed a spectacular procession of 'all the treasures of Poland', looted by the Duke of Bohemia Břetislav I. In his Chronicle of the Czechs, Cosmas of Prague describes in some detail the triumphal burden carried back from Gniezno. At the head of the retinue came the duke, carrying the 'sweet weight' of the body of St Adalbert. Then came the priestly elites with the bodies of the saint's brother, Bishop Gaudentius, and the bodies of the five martyred brethren—all taken from their graves in Gniezno. The sacred relics were followed by magnificent handcrafted treasures. Twelve priests struggled to sustain the weight of a golden crucifix, allegedly cast from an amount of gold three times the weight of its Piast patron. Then followed three tablets 'heavy with gold' and studded with precious stones—probably the altar frontals given by Otto III on his visit to the shrine of Adalbert in the year 1000. Cosmas reports that an inscription on one of the panels celebrated its great weight. These sacred treasures were followed by 'more than one hundred wagons' filled with such abundance of wealth that the witnesses of the triumph were convinced that Břetislav had left nothing behind.

This raid and the devastation of 1039 marks the end of the first chapter of the history of Christianised Poland and of its first Christian art. The subsequent reconstitution and regeneration of the Polish polity was accompanied by ambitious campaigns of church building and monastic foundation. This patronage culminated in the second half of the twelfth century with some of the finest examples of Romanesque art in central Europe.

But what of that largely lost material world of the first dukes, Mieszko I (d. 992) and his son Bolesław Chrobry (d.1025)? Both men sought to extend and enhance their territorial power through embracing the new religion of the Christ-God and demonstrating their conversion through investment in sacred treasure. The various accounts of the meeting of Otto III and Bolesław in Gniezno in the year 1000 are all eloquent on the material magnificence of the Polish reception of the emperor. At the same time, the very recent pagan past of the duke and his subjects seems to have strongly resonated among the observers, and its legacy was still visible. Archaeological finds demonstrate that this must have been particularly observable in weapons and armour. Indeed, the lavish display of Bolesław's piety was accompanied by a display of military magnificence, as he presented Otto with three hundred mounted warriors—a particularly pleasing gift, according to Thietmar of Merseburg. The impression made by this display was only heightened for the

emperor and his entourage by the exotic quality of the rows of colourful warriors dressed in gilded armour and wearing horse-tailed chichak helmets.

‘Would it not be better’, asked Bruno of Querfurt in his celebrated letter to Emperor Henry II, ‘to fight with pagans for the sake of Christianity than to inflict violence on Christians for the sake of secular honour?’ Bruno’s question—a bold reprimand of the emperor—demonstrates the complexity of Bolesław’s standing and status as a Christian prince whose veneer of piety was suspected by some to be as thin as the layer of gold on his breast plate. The meeting of Otto and Bolesław in 1000 must have been a showcase of the syncretic world where the might and customs of the pagan warrior elite interlocked with the political, spiritual and material influence of the Church and the Christian Empire of the Romans. This paper aims to bring together the material and textual evidence of this syncretic dialogue.

Today only a minute fraction of the treasures of Mieszko and Bolesław have survived. What was left after the raid of Břetislav perished in subsequent centuries—some of it, indeed, as late as 1945. But the remaining artefacts, combined with several textual sources, allow us a glimpse at the lost corpus of portable wealth of the early Polish polity. This paper aims to draw a clearer picture of the sacred and secular treasure of the saints and dukes in Poland around the end of the first Christian millennium—a time when, according to the early twelfth-century chronicler Gallus Anonymus, gold ‘was considered by all to be as common as silver, while silver was regarded as straw’.

Béla Zsolt Szakács

The Year 1000 in Hungary: Turning Point or Continuation?

Was there life in Hungary before 1000? This question is automatically posed in traditional Hungarian historiography. The iconic figure of Saint Stephen of Hungary, the first king of the country (canonized in 1083) overshadows everything prior to his reign (997-1038). Latin dioceses were organised during his lifetime and the first Benedictine monasteries were established. As a result, between eight and ten cathedrals were established, along with at least six monasteries. The ruins of half dozen buildings survive. While traditionally almost every significant church in Hungary was attributed to the early 11th century, the foundation dates for many have been re-dated to later periods in recent decades. As a result, the founding period of Hungarian Christianity has been partially emptied out; nevertheless, our knowledge is based on more solid observations.

Kalocsa Cathedral is one of the best-known examples, being related in its structure to Sankt Pantaleon II in Cologne. The first phase of the Benedictine Abbey of Pannonhalma with its western apse, crypt, transept and towers can also be compared to such buildings as Sankt Stephan in Würzburg. Products of the sumptuous arts commissioned by King Stephen and his wife, Gisela (like the later Coronation Mantel, originally a chasuble and the Gisela Cross) belong to an artistic circle based in Regensburg. Thus, orientation towards the Holy Roman Empire is evident. However, Italian connections are also manifested in other commissions such as the chancel of the royal basilica of Székesfehérvár or the palmette decoration of many early buildings, which derive from the Adriatic. These cultural connections can be explained by the presence of missionaries from both Germany and Italy.

Contrary to traditional Hungarian historiography, scholarship in neighbouring countries looked for earlier signs of Christianity. Recent research has demonstrated that the survival of Carolingian structures acted as a considerable influence on the establishment of new foundations after 1000. Re-dating churches on the western periphery of the Carpathian Basin (e.g. Kopcany and Kostolany) to before 1000 proves that Christianity did not simply disappear with the arrival of pagan Hungarians. Moreover, churches with a Carolingian origin were in use through the tenth century and served as a basis for the new Hungarian Christianity in centres such as Visegrád, Zalavár or Kaposszentjakab. In the eastern part of the kingdom, a recently excavated church in Alba Iulia (Gyulafehérvár) poses questions of continuity between the Orthodox mission of the tenth century and the newly established Latin bishoprics after 1000.

Thus, we find that the cultural predecessors to the founding of bishoprics in the early 11th century can no longer be neglected – even if the new era ushers in a different artistic orientation. The year 1000 symbolizes both a continuity and a turning point in the artistic culture of the Carpathian Basin.

FRIDAY 10 SEPTEMBER – SESSION 8 (JOHN McNEILL)

Michele Luigi Vescovi

Looking North: Architecture in Emilia circa 1000

Romanesque art and architecture in Emilia are often associated with majestic twelfth-century cathedrals and abbey churches, such as those at Piacenza, Parma, Nonantola and Modena, and are linked with the activity of the most innovative sculptors and architects of the period, most notably Wiligelmus, Lanfrancus and Nicholas. Much less considered is the richness and complexity of the monumental landscape in Emilia around the year 1000, a topic that, over the last few decades, has received increased scholarly attention. However, the implications of new discoveries, as well as of new methodological approaches, have not yet been fully integrated into broader debates on Romanesque architecture.

This paper considers architecture in Emilia at the turn of the first millennium (ca. 980-1020), with a primary focus on the area between Piacenza and Modena. At its core, it presents two buildings, Sant'Antonino in Piacenza (consecrated 1014) and Sant'Uldarico in Parma (c. 1000). The former is dedicated to a local bishop and saint, Antonino, and it housed his remains, while the latter—whose medieval structures I discovered only a few years ago—is dedicated to a 'German' saint, Ulrich of Augsburg, recently canonised at the time of its construction. In both cases, a local bishop promoted their construction. Analysis of these two sites, it will be argued, shows the deployment of architectural elements and languages that were novel within the geographical framework of northern Italy at that time, but extremely common north of the Alps, in the Ottonian and Salian Empire. The investigation of the personal, familial and political background of the bishops, and the networks to which they belonged, reveal viable connections with the Empire, showing the extent to which, at the turn of the first millennium, architecture in Emilia was looking north.

Richard Gem

England 970-1030: Architecture of the Monastic Reform

The most important architectural projects in England in the late 10th century were undertaken by the leaders of the movement for the reform of the church along monastic lines, influenced by the monasteries of Ghent and Fleury. They were Dunstan, archbishop of Canterbury; Æthelwold, bishop of Winchester; and Oswald, bishop of Worcester and archbishop of York. Their work was dependent on the support of the monarchy, especially of King Eadgar and his successors. The impetus of the movement continued into the early 11th century and into the reign of King Cnut, the Danish conqueror of England.

Virtually none of their buildings remains standing today, but some can be reconstructed on the basis of archaeological and documentary evidence. A key number of these lost major monuments will be examined: at Peterborough, Winchester, Ramsey, St Edmunds and Canterbury. Some of their Continental parallels will be referred to. These buildings would have been embellished with architectural ornament, sculpture, wall paintings and treasures of precious metals and textiles, and some extant examples of these arts will be adduced from minor buildings to throw light on the lost arts of the major buildings.

It will be concluded that in England there was no indigenous development towards Romanesque art in the period 970-1030, but that architecture remained essentially conservative, although with some references to contemporary Continental buildings. In England the development of Romanesque began only c.1050.

Eric Fernie

St Laurence's at Bradford-on-Avon, St Michael's at Hildesheim, and the use of squares in their planning

St Laurence's has been chosen because of the clarity of its planning system. The presentation seeks to demonstrate that, taking account of errors, all the major dimensions in the plan are based on only two lengths, c. 3.12m and c. 4.03m, and their relationship to squares of those sizes. These characteristics will allow it to be used as something which is both similar to and very different from St Michael's. It is not proposed that there is any link between the two buildings. (This is a revised study of the account of the planning of St Laurence's in *The Architecture of the Anglo-Saxons*, 1983, p. 148.)

The examination of St Michael's sets out Otto von Simson's analysis of the plan, in which he proposes that the transepts and the nave are each formed of three squares, but with the squares oddly laid out. I shall disagree with von Simson in two respects. First, I shall propose that at least the west transept was laid out as three proper squares. Second, while I agree that the three bays making up the nave are indeed only like squares, I shall disagree with his explanation that the oddity is due to the architect having used overlapping squares, laid out sometimes to the inner face of a wall and sometimes to the outer.

The paper concludes with a discussion of the relevance of these squares and shapes to the identification of St Michael's as an early example of the Romanesque style. St Michael's has justifiably played a key role in debates about this subject, with conclusions ranging from complete rejection through partial relevance to full acceptance. The use of squares in the plan is of central importance in this debate. It is hoped that this investigation will clarify the role of these forms in the designing of St Michael's and hence its place in the development of the style.