

# BRITISH ARCHAEOLOGICAL ASSOCIATION



## Poitiers Romanesque Conference Abstracts

### Claude-Andrault-Schmitt

*The epistemological, political and practical issues affecting regional categories in French Romanesque architecture*

Categorisation by region is an important element in French Romanesque historiography. It should be understood in relation to the circumstances and purposes of its birth in the 19th century. When French scholars wrote to their provincial correspondents from Paris, their aim was to develop a simple typology that would help in the creation of early lists of protected monuments. Some also wished to build a true 'science', in which vaults, arches, abutments and other means of articulation became determinants in the definition of architectural groups, just as petals, sepals and roots defined botanical *genera*. Moreover, some scholars were tempted to develop a theory of regional styles because of an ideological and conservative background in the field of folklore.

Thus, regional architectural typologies became evidence for regional specificity. Of course, much of what appears regional results from emulation, particular technical skills, and the use of local tools and local stones. But the attractive and popular mental landscape compounded by *les écoles romanes* has profound consequences. Firstly, it conceals the exceptional. Secondly, it emphasises structural features over what was presumably visible and important to the medieval faithful: impressiveness on the one hand and architectural detailing on the other. Thirdly, and that is the most significant implication, a concern for regional style determined the ways buildings were restored. Many Romanesque churches are now considered to be paragons of a 'regional' style, but are, in fact the consequence of a 19th-century vision and a Romanesque Revival.

### Eric Fernie

*Hans Kubach's Treatment of Regions in the Study of Romanesque architecture*

One of the exceptions to the overall tendency to categorize the Romanesque by regions is to be found in the work of Hans Kubach. Using his *Architektur der Romanik* of 1974, and especially the central chapter dealing with church buildings of the years between c.1070 and c.1150, the paper examines his preference for the *Kunstlandschaft* in the explanation of groups and variations, and his concomitant rejection of the role of both ecclesiastical and secular units, or what might be called political and social forms. This means that master masons are the chief and in some cases the only category of people determining the design of the buildings. His approach is particularly clearly demonstrated in the three sections into which the chapter is divided, namely the vaulted basilica, the flat-ceiling basilica and mature forms in southwestern Europe, indicating the primacy of the elements which make up the buildings. The geographical label is used to avoid giving significance to the political units of France and the kingdoms of northern Spain.

In a related case, to do with the explanatory power of another social phenomenon, the pilgrimage, Kubach rejects the grouping of five churches associated with that to Santiago, on the grounds that there are churches of the same type which are not on the pilgrimage routes. This argument is also assessed.

## **Philip Bovey**

### *Did Zodiaque's Regional Portrayal create a False Impression as to the Nature of Romanesque*

Zodiaque\* is, on any measure, the largest collection of published images of Romanesque architecture and sculpture ever to have been produced. The main series is organised on a regional basis with introductions describing the character of the architectural styles of the region concerned. Some regard the collection as simply a quarry, with texts which are now of only limited interest. Others are dismissive of the religious origin of the enterprise. On the other hand, while the quality of the photographs and their presentation is generally recognised, they have been criticised for imposing an overall vision of the subjects so as to 'maintain the fiction that they are connected to a centripetal, or ideologically-unifying, norm', and for portraying 'a vision of Romanesque art [which] differs profoundly from that of its contemporaries'. Others praise the collection for 'evok[ing] a vision...which changed our view of the thousands of monuments making up the architectural fabric of medieval Europe' and 'an emotion' which enables us to 'travers[e] the centuries' and 'sense that [there is] a magical past [which] never ceased', while cautioning that the images are 'so alluring that they threaten[ ] to create a unitary notion of Romanesque surfaces'.

These reactions need to be taken seriously. We are influenced by images and by their presentation even, perhaps especially, by images of buildings we know well. This influence is largely subconscious and therefore much harder to discount in the way that we can do with a written argument. If the portrayal is sufficiently powerful to cause these reactions then we need to understand what inspired the vision and how it is conveyed. Is the vision false? Does it mislead us into thinking that there is a trans-regional unity in Romanesque which is not there? We need to go back to the sources.

The paper will argue that there are three linked sources for the vision: first, its genesis at a very particular moment in the political and religious history of France, secondly the artistic training of the driving force behind the collection, Dom Angelico Surchamp, and the application of this training to photography, and thirdly a particular view, again inspired by the time it was created, of the nobility of artisan labour. Thus:

Catholicism  
Cubism  
Craftsmanship

It will conclude that, in its own terms, the vision is well-founded and important but that it is not necessarily the same as that produced by a more purely academic analysis.

Dom Angelico Surchamp, the driving force behind Zodiaque, died on 1 March this year while this paper was being written. For a brief summary in English of his contribution to Romanesque see the blog posted by one of his US admirers Dennis Aubrey: <https://vialucispress.wordpress.com/2018/03/02/the-passing-of-a-giant-dennis-aubrey/>

\*The term 'Zodiaque' is used to cover only the journals and volumes produced by the monks of La Pierre-qui-Vire and not the various titles which have appeared since the name was sold.

## **Marcello Angheben**

### *Romanesque Sculpture in the Former Duchy of Aquitaine: A History of the Marginalisation of a Widely-Imitated Regional Sculptural Style*

The historiography of Romanesque sculpture in France holds that the most important creative centres are Burgundy and Languedoc and has represented work in the former duchy of Aquitaine – namely Poitou, Saintonge and Angoumois – as late, regional, largely ornamental, and unsympathetic to the paradigm for Romanesque portals, which is that they should be provided with a tympanum. In order de to restore the importance of this

sculpture, my paper will deal successively with the historiography, the chronology of Romanesque sculpture in Aquitaine and south-western France, the issue of portals without tympana, their iconography and their artistic quality. One of the most important points is that what is found elsewhere on tympana was largely located at the top of the façades – namely theophanies. What is more, the west portal at Aulnay was the most influential in all Romanesque France, as it inspired a total of eighteen portals which survive between Bordeaux and Tournai.

The case of Tournai Cathedral perfectly illustrates enthusiasm for this sculpture given that, when the canons decided to adorn their church with historiated portals, they hired sculptors who were familiar with the portals of Aulnay and Moissac, but who clearly preferred the former. Spanish facades will also be mentioned because they show that in the second half of the 12th century, patrons continued to commission portals without tympana beneath theophanies.

To address the iconographical richness of Aquitanian sculpture, the program evident at the Abbaye-aux-Dames in Saintes will be compared to that of Moissac. This comparison enables one to see that the complexity of a programme is large part depends on the skill of the sculptors. The paper concludes with a brief overview of the artistic qualities of the finest sculptors working in Aquitaine, those active in Angoulême and Poitiers, whose work is comparable to that of their colleagues at Moissac and Cahors. As only a few years separate these works, the paper will conclude by asserting that sculpture in Aquitaine should be viewed alongside that of Languedoc and not in the framework of a regional or peculiarly late Romanesque art.

## **Richard Gem**

*Ordering and decorating the sanctuary and choir: the defining visions of three great patrons and their international context (c.1020-1070)*

The paper starts from the premise that the celebration of the liturgy, the primary function of church buildings, was focussed on the choir and sanctuary. The architecture surrounding these elements might take varied forms, while within the architectural shell there were common practical requirements for the ordering of the space. However, beyond practicalities, patrons might seek to express a broader religious and aesthetic vision through the furnishing and decoration of the sanctuary and choir, and this is the subject of the paper.

The projects of three major 11th-century patrons will be examined: Gauzlin, abbot of Fleury (1004-1030); his contemporary Oliba, abbot of Ripoll (1008-1046); and in the next generation Desiderius, abbot of Montecassino (1058-1087). In each case five aspects will be considered:

- (i) the nature of the overall project undertaken by the patron;
- (ii) the location within the building of the sanctuary and choir;
- (iii) the provision of the liturgical furnishings;
- (iv) the structural decoration of these parts;
- (v) the provision of textile decorations.

Limitations of time preclude consideration of other aspects, such as the provision of liturgical plate, texts and vestments.

It will be shown that across space and time these patrons aimed at the greatest magnificence that their resources could command, drawing together craftsmen from different regions and countries, as far afield as Byzantium. The vision that united them in their patronage, however, was not simply an aspiration towards magnificence, but one more focussed on asserting a liturgical vision that looked ultimately to Rome and its traditions. In this they stood in continuity with the past, while also preparing the way for subsequent Romanesque developments.

## **Teemu Immonen**

*The Inner Circle: The College of cardinals and the Formation of Romanesque Art*

Peter Damian concludes a letter written to the monks of Montecassino, probably in the winter of 1063–1064, with the following words: ‘And if you should find it to your liking, you might inscribe this distich in the refectory, under the feet of the apostles: *Fiery tongues then appeared to inflame the assembled apostles, like a bounteous voice from on high, they now grow to produce diverse language.*’ Peter’s words shed light on the ways that

personal contacts between the leading representatives of the Gregorian reform movement may have contributed to the dissemination of artistic ideas during the formative years of Romanesque art.

My paper is an exploration of the role played by social relations between the members of the College of Cardinals in the formation of Romanesque art. The ecclesiastical reform movement had drastically changed the nature of the College of Cardinals. From the time of Leo IX, cardinals were increasingly recruited from outside Rome, from the ranks of the most prominent churchmen of the Western Christendom. Intellectually, this was a decisive moment. For the first time in history, the brightest minds of the West were brought together annually at the Lenten Council. The cardinals could have frequently discussed topics from politics through questions of theology to art. Such contacts often led to close friendships which expressed themselves in visits and correspondence. Indeed, Peter Damian's letters are one of our main sources for the importance of personal contacts. His letters reveal an intense interest in artistic questions at time when Roman Romanesque art was taking shape. My paper considers Romanesque art as a result of communication, both at the highest level of the hierarchy of the Church and at the local level - where the universalist ideals of papal Rome were interwoven with regional traditions

## **Manuel Castiñeiras**

### *The Baldachin-Ciborium: The Shifting Meanings of a Restricted Liturgical Furnishing*

For Romanesque viewers, the *baldachin-ciborium* over the high altar was a rare and distinguished element in the liturgical furnishing of a church. Beginning in Rome, where *ciboria* had flourished since the 4th century and continued to flourish through the Middle Ages, the ciborium acted as a prominent sign in basilicas *ad corpus* or in sanctuaries above reliquary crypts (Old St Peter's, Santa Maria in Cosmedin, Lateran Cathedral, Santa Maria Maggiore, etc). Its use was restricted even in Romanesque Italy. Indeed, 11th and 12th-century Italian examples - such as those of Montecassino, San Nicola in Bari or those in the Abruzzi - should be seen as echoes of Papal Roman settings, while that at San Pietro, Civate probably relates to the emerging symbolism of Christ's aedicule in Jerusalem.

Outside Italy, *baldachin-ciboria* over high altars are exceptional, and seem to be restricted to places and institutions especially concerned to display their adherence to papal authority as a guarantor of their rights. Thus, the baldacchino at Old St Peter's is the symbolic and ideological model for those at Cluny, Ripoll, Cuxa, Vic and Santiago de Compostela.

Notwithstanding the above, as with other forms of 'prototype' and 'copy' in the middle ages, the evocation of a prestigious model doesn't imply a facsimile, and in some cases the choice of materials and figurative ornamentation added new meanings to the *baldachin-ciborium*. Thus, in 11th-century Catalonia *ciboria* were described as the *sancta sanctorum* of the Temple of Jerusalem and their pictorial programmes introduced new themes that were later incorporated into Romanesque mural and panel painting. In other later cases, such as that of the mid-12th-century replacement for the Ripoll canopy, or that of the twin baldacchini at San Juan del Duero (Soria), the significance of these liturgical furnishings was updated to reflect Eucharistic themes and evoke Christ's tomb in Jerusalem.

## **Gaetano Curzi**

### *Romanesque Woodcarvers and Plasterers in the Abruzzi: The Mediterranean Connection*

In the twelfth century, wooden doors, iconostasis screens, altars, thrones and chests were carved and painted in Lazio, Campania and Abruzzi, following a tradition that had probably first developed in the previous century at Monte Cassino under Desiderius. Indeed, in his Chronicle Leo Marsicano proudly describes the various different materials and techniques which Desiderius used and where, in addition to marble and precious metals, wood seems to have played an important role. The iconostasis, for example, consisted of a wooden beam that was splendidly carved and decorated with silver, gold and purple, but which did not survive the earthquake of 1349. A scaled-down version of this survives in the church of Santa Maria in Valle Porclaneta (Rosciolo dei Marsi), which had belonged to Monte Cassino since 1064.

It is similarly of interest to note the wooden doors at the Greek abbey at Grottaferrata, at Santa Maria in Cellis (Carsoli) and at San Pietro in Albe (Alba Fucens), all of which show evidence of an awareness of Muslim forms

and of work from the opposite side of the Adriatic Sea in the first half of the 12<sup>th</sup> century. Analysis of these works, especially from the perspective of recent discoveries, sheds light on the close relationship that existed between Abruzzi, Campania and Apulia in this period.

In a similar vein, work that can be associated with the workshop of Ruggero, Roberto and Nicodemo will be considered. This workshop was responsible for stucco ciboria and pulpits (at S. Clemente al Vomano, S. Maria in Valle Porcaneta and S. Maria al Lago a Moscufo) decorated with elaborate scrolls and imaginative ornamental motifs that reveal long-range influences.

## **Rosa Maria Bacile**

*The Use of Porphyry in the Norman Kingdom of Sicily: An exclusive commodity of King Roger II or the establishment of a new regional style by a new monarchy?*

In the Norman Kingdom of Sicily, cathedrals and churches commissioned and built by the Norman Kings between 1130 to 1174 made lavish use of porphyry. In the cathedrals of Palermo and Monreale, five porphyry sarcophagi and their canopies, all or partly made of porphyry, testify to the abundance of this precious stone in the capital of the new Kingdom. Porphyry is also used extensively in the Cappella Palatina, where the royal throne, the altar, the ambo, the floor and the columns supporting the dome are all crafted from the stone; in the church of Santa Maria dell'Amiraglio (the church commissioned by King Roger's chief minister, George of Antioch) where the pavement is covered with porphyry *rotae*, as are the floors of the cathedrals of Cefalù, Palermo and Monreale. In all these buildings and in buildings in the peninsular part of the kingdom, porphyry is present within sculptural programmes, floors and in liturgical furnishings.

Porphyry had been regarded since ancient times as an exclusive commodity reserved to the few rulers who could afford it; and was only displayed in imperial chapels, for example, in Aachen under Charlemagne, or in the imperial private apartments of the Byzantine emperors. Porphyry has always been appreciated for its lustre and purple colour, for its rarity, and for its hardness, a factor that made its extraction, transportation, and carving extremely complex and expensive. Throughout the Middle Ages and Renaissance, porphyry could only be obtained from antique *spolia*, for which Rome became the main source. Rome and the Mediterranean became the centre for the trade in marbles and precious stones – thus material for the furnishing of the abbey of Monte Cassino, and the cathedrals of Pisa and Lucca were imported from Rome. Even so, in these buildings the presence of porphyry is scarce compared to its abundance in the Norman Kingdom of Sicily. The trade in stone and other valuable materials continued throughout the medieval period. Abbot Suger in *Libellus alter de consecratione ecclesiae S. Dionysii* states that Rome is the best source for acquiring precious materials.

This paper will argue that the porphyry in Palermo was most probably imported into the Norman Kingdom from Rome. The import of the stone from Rome is evidence that King Roger II was a potent figure in trade negotiations with the Pope and other important Roman families such as the Pierleoni and Frangiapani, and was the only ruler in the East or West who could afford to acquire such an exclusive commodity on such a scale during the Middle Ages.

The paper will then challenge the idea that porphyry was used by the Norman dynasty as an exclusive commodity and argue that the widespread use of the stone, especially in cathedrals open to a wider audience, suggests it was used to establish a new regional style. This new style, in turn, acted as political propaganda for the new Norman monarchy; firstly in defiance of the authority of the Pope to whom the power of the Norman King was in theory dependent. Secondly such wide use of the material represented a challenge to other contemporary secular rulers who possessed neither the means nor the political connections that enabled them to obtain this rare stone.

## **Julia Perratore**

*Crossing the Pyrenees: Transregional Collaboration in the Shaping of Romanesque Aragon*

Two historical phenomena have long dominated the historiography of trans-Pyrenean artistic transfer during the Romanesque period: the pilgrimage to Santiago de Compostela and the expansion of monastic networks. Without question, both played significant roles in facilitating artistic communication. Yet their place in the scholarly spotlight has led to the marginalization of another key phenomenon determining trans-Pyrenean artistic transfer:

urbanism. The dynamic mechanisms of urban growth generated building projects on either side of the mountains, but the fruits of transregional collaboration are particularly notable in the architectural sculpture of Aragon. As the young kingdom's conquests of Muslim-ruled territory began to accumulate during the late 11th century, its rulers endeavoured to organize and settle the land through the development of urban centers. Warriors and migrants from both sides of the Pyrenees participated in the conquest and settlement of Aragon, and the contributions of both Aquitanian and Aragonese patrons and artists were no less integral to building up towns across the kingdom.

Transregional artistic collaborations in Aragon gave rise to a monumental visual culture that would, in turn, impact the social and spiritual life of growing communities throughout the Iberian Peninsula. In this paper, I explore patterns of artistic interaction among patrons and sculptors during a crucial period of urban development in Aragon, c. 1125-1175. The crucible of transregional collaboration during this half century was the town of Uncastillo, where sculptors trained on opposite sides of the Pyrenees came together to fuse complementary styles and share iconographic repertoires at the churches of Santa María and San Miguel. I examine these sculptors' activities in Uncastillo and beyond, tracing a web of artistic relationships linking the Midi, Aragon, and Navarra. Considering artistic transfer as one manifestation of the movement of people on a larger scale, I seek to reveal the artistic impact of migration, urban growth, and community formation during this dynamic era of Aragon's history.

## **Richard Plant**

### *Rolduc and Reception*

The spread of motifs from south of the Alps to the northern part of the western Roman Empire has long been acknowledged and widely studied. The more celebrated buildings concerned received Imperial patronage: Speyer, Quedlinburg and, somewhat later, Königsutter, but the effect of Italian sculptors in these centres, if such they were, was local and purely sculptural.

In the Meuse Valley and the Lower Rhine, themselves contested art-historical 'regions', the spread of sculptural motifs, and an architectural form (the nave transept or pseud-transept), derived from Italy, was more widespread. There is also a putative point of reception and a document to back it up. The *Annales Rodensis* claim that the abbey church of Rolduc, or Kerkrade (Limburg), was built 'scemate Longobardo'. The document purports to show awareness of an alien style, and therefore implicitly a local style from which it was different, and identifies a point of origin for that style, all features which are rather rare in documents from the 12th century. The document is, of course, problematic: slightly later than the building itself which, was, in turn, constructed in an extended and rather fraught building campaign.

Apart from the problem of the point of reception, this paper will address wider issues of reception: why and in what ways, within areas of evident architectural activity, transregional forms transformed the architecture and sculpture of particular areas, what transformations the motifs themselves were subject to, and what this might tell us about 'regionality' in the Romanesque period.

## **Wilfried Keil**

### *'School' or 'masons' workshop'? - Reflections on the so-called 'Wormser Bauschule' and on the definition of regional style*

As it is well known, the definition of regional styles in Romanesque art and architecture has long been associated with the existence of 'schools'. The concept emerged in the nineteenth century, but in my paper, I want to consider the issues raised by the problematic category of 'schools' in relation to the so-called *Wormser Bauschule* (school of Worms).

The origins of this term cannot be defined precisely, however, already in the nineteenth century, Worms Cathedral and other churches built later that shared stylistic similarities, were described by Ernst Wörner as a *Wormser Kunstrichtung* (style of Worms). Georg Dehio mentioned for the first time a *Wormser Schule* (school of Worms) in 1919 and shortly afterwards, when Richard Harmann published his book on German and French medieval art, the term *Wormser Bauschule* (architectural school of Worms) was already firmly established (Hamann 1922).

The term referred not only to the nave and the eastern parts of Worms Cathedral but to other churches built within this tradition. This concept has subsequently never been contested and it reached its climax in the book *Wormser Bauschule 1000-1250* by Walter Hotz (Hotz 1985).

In my paper I will focus in particular on one decorative form invented in Worms Cathedral at the beginning of the twelfth century, and then follow its deployment in other buildings in the city, in the region and even beyond that – thus touching to issues related to transregional styles. This form (called in German *Hornauslauf*) is a particular type of ending applied to the vertical profiles of lesenes (pilaster strips), and can be found in both the exterior and the interior of buildings. Recent detailed study of the east end of Worms Cathedral allowed us to redefine the chronology of this part of the church, dating it to the beginning of the twelfth century. However, the implications of this new chronology for our understanding of the *Wormser Bauschule* still needs to be investigated.

Tracing the progressive deployment of the *Hornauslauf*, I will question how, and by what means, these solutions have been deployed. Does this mark the activity of a ‘school’? Or, rather, is ‘school’ the right concept by which to group and define different workshops active in the city of Worms (at St. Andreas, St. Paul, St. Martin, and the Synagogue), in its region (for example at Frankenthal, Seebach and Bechtheim), but also beyond the boundaries of its diocese? The *Hornauslauf*, in fact, is found in the dioceses of Mainz, Metz, Speyer, Strasbourg and Würzburg. In my paper, I want to shift the emphasis from the concept of one, unitary ‘School’ to that of different workshops. I will question how decorative elements were transmitted between workshops, revealing a rich network of interchanges. These interchanges call into question the idea of artistic geography. Could the activity of these workshops define the boundaries of artistic ‘regions’, or do these workshops, active simultaneously in different dioceses, cut across territorial boundaries? Finally, what does this investigation reveal about our definition of regional and transregional style in the Upper Rhine Valley?

## **John McNeill**

### *The Herefordshire School Revisited*

On the evidence of surviving buildings, the forms and styles of architectural sculpture developed in Aquitaine between *c.* 1070 and *c.* 1140 were widely admired, most notably in England and Spain where significant numbers of sculptural compositions are western French in origin. For the most part these compositions are imitative, or at least that is the case in England. They are the work of locally-based masons, and the sculpture is subordinated to a set of aesthetic and architectural preferences that are purely Anglo-Norman. However, there are instances where the relationship between the English ‘imitation’ and the western French ‘source’ suggests a more complex *modus operandi*. One such example was potentially identified by George Zarnecki over half a century ago in the work of a sculptural atelier he called the ‘Herefordshire School’. It is their work, and the evidence it contains for the import of a transregional sculptural composition that is the subject of this paper.

As used by Zarnecki, the term ‘Herefordshire School’ did not indicate a regional style or a set of regional preferences that endured. It simply referred to a dedicated sculptural workshop which co-existed with other more purely local workshops. Definitive evidence for its make-up is lacking, though it is likely that it consisted of at least two, possibly three, principal sculptors - one of whom may have been active only briefly and, it will be argued, was recruited from the Poitou. The workshop specialised in small-scale commissions, producing several portals, chancel arches, tympana and fonts, and was clearly a dedicated sculptural atelier whose work was incorporated into churches built to different designs and in different materials.

Though regional in activity, the workshop was notably open to external influence - for the most part eschewing established local forms in favour of highly varied compositions that were applied to both buildings and furnishings. That they regularly collaborated with other masons may be a reason why the workshop seems to have been both flexible and suggestible. The aesthetic owes much to western French practice though the sources for the majority of the motifs deployed, as well as the relative importance given to particular architectural features, is not western French. Examination of the work of the ‘Herefordshire School’ may shed light on the potential for specific workshops to affect larger regional approaches to sculptural styles and preferences.

## Tancredi Bella

*The cathedrals of Norman Sicily and their relationship with transregional and transalpine models: Between Historiography and New Study*

The foundation of the dioceses and construction of cathedrals at Troina (1080), Agrigento, Mazara del Vallo, Syracuse, Catania (1086-1094) and Messina under the guidance of French monks from Calabria were important steps in Count Roger's political and ecclesiastical strategy for Sicily. This is known from Goffredo Malaterra, a Benedictine monk from Saint-Evroult-en-Ouche in southern Normandy, who travelled to Catania and reported on the Norman conquest of Sicily. A few years earlier, Roger had founded two abbeys in Calabria - Sta Maria at Sant'Eufemia (1062-1065) and SS. Trinità in Mileto (1062-1080) – both now unfortunately destroyed. However, it is possible to hypothesize that their plans were based on the model of Cluny II (consecrated in 981); an apse-echelon model which had been adopted in Normandy and Brittany at Notre-Dame, Bernay, as well as at Lonlay, Saint-Martin de Boscherville, Cerisy-la-Forêt, etc. This architectural plan was then transferred, along with other architectural practices, to southern Italy via Benedictine monastic communities, and was finally transferred to Sicily where it was used in the first Norman cathedrals.

Twentieth-century historians saw in the apse-echelon design, new for southern Italy, a transalpine model imported by Norman clients. Certain similarities between the plan of the SS. Trinità in Mileto and the cathedral of Cefalù (1131) have been seen to support this interpretation. However, in 2007 Francesco Gandolfo, drew attention to a number of problems with this hypothesis.

Based on Gandolfo's intelligent re-reading of the buildings, my paper will reconsider the historiographic myth of the diffusion of Cluniac models in southern Italy in the light of new archival and archaeological research, much of it unpublished. Despite the damage caused by earthquake or reconstruction, especially in modern times, it is now possible to study the plan and articulation of some of the more important early Norman cathedrals in Sicily at Troina and Catania. Perhaps then it will be possible to establish a better understanding of the origins of the plan adopted by the cathedral of Cefalù which, rightly or wrongly, has been seen to be as the climax in the process whereby an architectural model was transformed in Sicily.

## Alexandra Gajewski

'Sine rege, sine principe': Approaches to categorizing the Abbey Church of Cluny (Cluny III) and its Followers

Around 1140, with the abbey of Cluny at the height of its powers and the great abbey church as good as completed, Abbot Peter the Venerable (ruled 1122-1156) lamented in a letter to the Master of the Temple that his abbey's lands were 'without king, without duke, without prince'. At the same time, the building site of Cluny provided a generation of architects and patrons with inspiration, influencing not only Cluny's nearby priory at Paray-le-Monial, but also the cathedral of Autun, the collegiate church of Beaune, and the abbey churches of Cîteaux and Morimond, both mother-houses of the rival Cistercian order. In the 19th century, Arcisse de Caumont and other architectural historians categorized these churches as collectively forming a Burgundian Romanesque school of architecture, a group that they identified as one of several regional schools of medieval France. This categorization still represents the framework in which we think about these churches, as many recent studies on architecture 'in Burgundy' demonstrate.

More generally, there has been surprisingly little critical appraisal of the 19th-century artistic geography of Romanesque architecture in France despite the fact that there is now excellent documentation on its perpetuation in the 20th-century, above all with the publication of the beautifully illustrated Zodiac series *la nuit des temps*. Certainly, there is no body of research in French historiography comparable to the thorough deconstruction of the idea of 'Gothic as a national art' in works like Colette Beaune's 1985 *Naissance de la Nation France*. Yet, not only did both conceptual models develop out of the same intellectual milieu that included scholars like Jules Michelet and Paul Vidal de la Blache, but they also are two parts of the same demonstration. In a newly unified, post-Revolutionary France, these scholars defined the specificity of the French nation as its transcendence of a regional diversity that was thought to originate in the Middle Ages. 19th-century French unity was seen as contingent on this erstwhile diversity. Gothic architecture with its origin in Paris represented an early tendency towards unity, Romanesque architecture with its regional schools the diversity. Both were part of the characteristics that made France 'a personality'.



Thus, tracing the genealogy of the regional approach helps to identify its fundamental weakness. It has less to do with medieval historical reality than with the political situation of 19th-century France. One group of scholars that has long signalled deep flaws in the 19th-century conception of regional France are the historians. For 11th- and 12th-century Burgundy, Georges Duby identified the fragmentation of power in the southern county of Mâconnais, taking into account Peter the Venerable's lament. Although Abbot Peter's words, based on Hosea 3:4, have been qualified since, Duby's insights into the absence of a Burgundian polity remain relevant and have been further underscored by Jean Richard. Indeed, evidence from romance literature also highlights the lack of a Burgundian identity in the conscience of the medieval nobility. But, if there was no Burgundy in the sense of a stable entity, how can we explain the cluster of churches belonging to varied institutions that were inspired by the abbey church of Cluny? The most successful alternative to artistic geography is to consider artistic influence in terms of networks based on family or institutional identity. Looking at the Cluny cluster in this light, points to a more historically-rooted definition of the artistic phenomenon.

## **Elizabeth Valdez del Álamo**

### *The Creation of Castilian Identity under Alfonso VIII and Leonor Plantagenet*

The marriage of Leonor Plantagenet to Alfonso VIII of Castile expanded Castilian ties to western France and England and consolidated the identity of Castile as separate from the kingdom of León, a division created by Alfonso's grandfather, Alfonso VII. Together, the Castilian regents patronized and encouraged art that made their realm distinct from its troublesome neighbours, León and Navarre, whose rulers attempted to seize Castile during Alfonso's minority.

The last quarter of the twelfth century saw an influx of English and west French artists working in projects in all media throughout Castile. Spanish and English painters collaborated on the Beatus manuscript produced in Cardaña, near Burgos, and even on a single miniature for the Bible of Burgos, both of c. 1175-1180. Wall paintings in the monastery of Arlanza, apparently by English artists, are attributable to the era of Alfonso and Leonor. The church of Santo Domingo of Soria echoes Notre-Dame la-Grande in Poitiers. In Carrión de los Condes, the church of Santiago bears a frieze that recalls the churches of western France. Furthermore, Marie-Madeleine Gauthier recognized 'le goût Plantagenêt' in the Limoges-style enamels produced in the Burgos region at this time, for example, the altar frontal of Santo Domingo de Silos. Alfonso's success in conquering Muslim territory is reflected in the integration of Islamic war booty into Christian reliquaries, and in the use of pseudo-Kufic script in manuscripts and enamel work. Leonor promoted the cult of Thomas Becket as part of her father's penance for his role in the Archbishop's assassination. During their reign Castile adopted a castle as its heraldic symbol alongside the Plantagenet leopard. With this influx of foreign art and artists into their realm, Alfonso and Leonor enriched the visual language of Castile, granting the kingdom a clear, identifiable regional identity.

## **Jordi Camps**

### *Transregionalism and Particularity in the Romanesque Woodcarving of Twelfth-Century Catalonia*

One of the cornerstones in the study of Romanesque art in Catalonia has been its connection with certain major artistic centres and with European styles. This is a major theme in the historiography of Catalan monumental painting and sculpture, which through stylistic and iconographical analysis has demonstrated close links with, among others, Languedoc, Provence and Lombardy. In the field of polychrome woodcarving, studies have been based on typological comparison: different groups have been defined according to workshops, areas, styles and chronology. It is evident that the different types correspond to those developed in general, but they present iconographical and stylistic variations that are clearly specific to Catalonia.

The series of *Majestats* (images of Christ on the Cross within the *Christus triumphans* type) is one of the most significant in Catalonia. There are clear iconographical links with examples from Tuscany, which raise the question of how far a prestigious and immensely popular image such as the *Volto Santo* in Lucca could influence Catalan examples – though we should also bear in mind the documented dressed crucifix of Limoges. In Catalonia, worship of the *Passio Ymaginis Domini* is recorded in places such as Girona and Vic in the tenth and eleventh centuries. What then were the reasons for the spread of such a specific type, with the overtones of an eastern Mediterranean origin that this entails?

For their part the *Deposition of Christ* groups contain the figures of the two thieves, Dismas and Gestas. This sets them apart from most depictions of this theme. Questions of liturgy and of an association with the Crucifixion scene (the *Calvaris*) have been put forward in order to understand this peculiarity. Once again generic factors are combined with those apparently associated with place or a particular area.

In some cases another question arises: how were three-dimensional images introduced to Catalonia in the twelfth century, when there is nothing comparable to what was happening in the Germanic world or in southern France in the tenth and eleventh centuries? Beyond needs arising from worship and liturgy, one must reconsider what influence the possible arrival of foreign artists might have had on the eruption of freestanding images. A striking case is that of the *Christ of Mijaran*, the only surviving element from a superb *Deposition* and the masterpiece of a group of carvings from the Pyrenean valleys of Aran and Boí. What models were used for this piece in an area of scant tradition, even in the field of the monumental relief? Possible points of reference in Languedoc, which provided significant precedents in stone sculpture, have disappeared. Moreover, some details of the works in the group have things in common with the most important group of paintings in the Boí Valley, from Sant Climent de Taüll. How important were the centre and its patrons, if we take these similarities to be significant?

Diversity in carvings of the Virgin is also notable, although these nevertheless adhere to compositional and iconographical features typical of Romanesque art. The group from La Cerdanya (bishopric of Urgell) forcefully expresses the existence of a specific model in a particular area. The group's masterpiece is the *Virgin of Ger*, stylistically similar to the figure of an angel in a group from Cologne. In this case we have to study the potential impact of importation, a means of transmission accepted for Limoges enamelled objects. The same has been proposed for a group of images covered in metal with examples located between the Auvergne and Catalonia (*Vierge de la Victoire de Tuir*, Roussillon). For these, it has been said that the obvious similarities between the images could be the result of a Marian pilgrimage route that had connected these regions since the early Middle Ages.

Although they were never a source of influence in other countries, the territories of the Catalan counts and bishops created monuments and works with a distinctive personality, often based on a synthesis of elements of diverse origins and with references back to their own tradition and place. Although they follow common European styles, the devotional images exhibit numerous variations associated with a particular valley, an episcopal territory, a great monastic centre or an unknown patron. In this paper I shall attempt to show how far intellectual, technical and formal aspects could have determined the various distinctive characteristics, and how these contributions are balanced with other European models and styles.

## **Michele Luigi Vescovi**

### *Santa Fede in Cavagnolo: Transregional Style, Monastic Networks*

The historiographical debate on Romanesque art in Piedmont (Italy) has cyclically shifted between two poles. Scholars have emphasised, on the one hand, the extent to which its style belongs to Lombardy and, on the other hand, given its geographical location, how the region was open to artistic connections with France. In this debate, the church of Santa Fede at Cavagnolo, usually dated to the first half of the twelfth century, has played a critical role, as it shows the adoption of uncommon solutions in the area, such as a barrel vault in the nave, the carved lunette over the portal, and the style of some of its interior capitals.

In this paper, I will analyse the architecture and sculpture of the church, arguing for the presence of two construction phases, and will then explore their respective models. The analysis of the first phase shows, as earlier scholars also believed, that the style of carvings and capitals does not fit comfortably within the Piedmont or Lombard tradition, but rather shows similarities with reliefs found in France. In tracing these models, a further issue should be considered, one that relates to the potential dynamics behind transregional styles. What has been overlooked within the debate on this church (and by extension on the conceptualization of the Romanesque style in Piedmont), is the institutional nature of the foundation. I will argue, based on late-medieval documentary evidence, that this church was a priory of Sainte-Foi in Conques. This institutional connection is paramount to our understanding of the unusual stylistic solutions adopted. This also raises fresh questions. Did sculptors move from the mother abbey to the priory, or did local masons adopt a new style? Finally, an analysis of monastic networks sheds light on the dynamics of patronage: why was Conques interested in founding a priory in this

particular area? Or, if it was a donation, who founded the church, what accounts for its dedication and under what circumstances was it then decided to donate the church to Conques?

## **Gerhard Lutz**

### *Hildesheim as a Nexus of Metalwork Production, c. 1130 – 1250*

Hildesheim's famous examples of metalwork, such as the bronze doors of bishop Bernward (993-1022) are cornerstones of medieval art. But Bernward, who apparently pulled together artists from elsewhere to complete his intellectually and artistically ambitious commissions, did not lay the groundwork for a constantly flourishing production in Hildesheim in the following decades. It was not until the second quarter of the 12th century, with the shrines of St. Godehard and Epiphanius as well as other ambitious commissions, that Hildesheim entered a new phase of luxury metalwork production. Hildesheim workshops produced a great number of objects which were subsequently delivered to large parts of Europe including Scandinavia and Russia. This paper will concentrate on artistic production between c. 1130 and 1250, its broader impact, and its relationship to other centers in the Harz region and beyond in the 12th and 13th centuries.

What factors contributed to the success of Hildesheim metalwork? In order to fully appreciate Hildesheim's production in the twelfth century one must consider its connections with other artistic and intellectual centres and the production of objects for export. The origins of this around 1130 are closely connected to Helmarshausen, an influential Benedictine abbey in the upper Weser valley, and to its goldsmith Roger. Although Helmarshausen has traditionally been viewed as the source of this resurgence in metalwork production, more recent research has suggested that the author of the *Schedula diversarum artium*, was possibly a monk from St. Michael's in Hildesheim, showing the close connections between these centres. Furthermore, examples from different media testify to Hildesheim's close ties with France which were based on the continuous exchange of the cathedral school with Paris as part of the curriculum of its students.

Hildesheim is an ideal case study for the discussion of problems connected with the localisation of objects in general and a means of highlighting its limitations: Works were moved and sold elsewhere, and workshops in neighbouring cities might have copied successful forms in competition with Hildesheim or as a political or ecclesiastical reference. Or, alternatively, did Hildesheim have an effective 'copyright' for certain forms?

The second question the paper will address is the problem of localization, differentiating objects produced in Hildesheim from those of other centres in the area such as Magdeburg or Braunschweig. In contrast to earlier research, the reconstruction of local artistic production in relation to alternative regional centres, and transregional forms as a means of exchange (e.g. trade and pilgrimage routes or marriage gifts), offers important insights into our general understanding of other forms of exchange in the 12th and 13th centuries. How did these forms of exchange work over long distances, and how were they facilitated and shaped by contemporary intellectual life and economic contact.

## **Aleuna Macarenko**

### *'Mosan Goldsmithing and its Outreach in the Rhineland, France and England*

At the heart of this communication lie works of art of Rhenish, English and French origin, all bearing the mark of the Mosan goldsmithing: works such as the portable altar from the Treasury of the abbey of Mönchengladbach, the shrine of Charlemagne at Aachen and of Heribert of Cologne from Deutz, the foot of a cross displayed at the Sandelin Museum in St-Omer, and the enamelled ciboria that fill with wonder visitors to the *Victoria & Albert Museum* (London) and the *Pierpont Morgan Library* (New-York).

This paper will be organised around three main points. First, I will establish the stylistic, iconographic and technical similarities that link these particular objects alongside works of art from the Meuse. I will then examine the various hypotheses that have been developed to explain these similarities (production in the Mosan region and subsequent export; production by itinerant Mosan artists invited to work abroad; production by local artists who had studied in the Mosan region; possible transmission of models, sketches or of objects themselves). Finally, I will ask why it was goldsmithing in particular, more than any other discipline or medium, that excited the interest of both patrons and craftsmen from the neighbouring regions.

This paper aims, chiefly through the historiography, to ask whether we should see in the desire to copy Lotharingian works an indication that during the middle ages, goldsmithing was considered a sign of regional identity by Mosans and their neighbours, as well as acting as a mark of quality or whether this interpretation is a creation of early 20th-century scholarship, marked by nationalism and an imperative need to create a regional identity which could be traced back to medieval times.

## **Sheila Bonde and Clark Maines**

### *TIRON: The Cultural Geography of a Monastic Order*

Scholarship on Romanesque art remains typically – and anachronistically - embedded in nineteenth-century notions of regionalism. Our paper will reassess the construct of twelfth-century French regional styles against the notion of intersecting religious and political territories and the (competing) idea of architecture sponsored by individual monastic orders.

Early in the twelfth century, Bernard of Abbeville and his companions established a new reformed Benedictine congregation (or order) at the site known today as Thiron-Gardais. By the middle of the same century, the community had erected a monumental, aisleless, cruciform church, with towers set in the angles between the choir and transept arms. What makes Sainte-Trinité de Tiron an excellent case for the exploring different notions of regionalism resides in the uniqueness of its geographic location. No eleventh- or twelfth-century church within Tiron's political region—the county of the Perche—nor within its religious/administrative region—the diocese of Chartres—is comparable to the size, plan and remarkable spatial experience of its interior. The Perche, and the site of Tiron within it, are liminal, to both Normandy and the Île-de-France. As a group of wandering hermits soon to become monastics, Bernard and his followers embraced this regional liminality, deliberately choosing forested sites removed from settlement. The liminal location of Tiron, as well as the regional singularity of its size, architectural plan and the experience of its interior, raise questions about the transmission of forms, ideas and meanings within and across the cultural geography of twelfth-century Europe.

The notion of region is a spatial one, but one that may be nuanced administratively, topographically, climatically, politically or artistically, among others. In this paper, we will consider ways in which the notion of region may (or may not) be usefully applied, first to the creation of Sainte-Trinité de Tiron, the monumental motherhouse of the new reformed order, and then to the architecture of the Tironensian congregation. We will consider region in terms of the sources of inspiration for the forms and meanings of Sainte-Trinité, whether these sources are defined formally or ideationally. We will explore explanations for understanding the relations between Tiron itself and the regions from which those sources were derived. In this approach, Sainte-Trinité de Tiron becomes the product of a layered notion of region and trans-region (administrative, geographic, political etc.) not unlike the layering of the GIS maps we use to display the regional sources of those forms and ideas. It also represents a palimpsest of different types of cultural geography, each coming from its own geographic and/or ideational region.

By the middle of the twelfth century, more than 80 dependent houses, some given and some newly built, had become part of Tiron's congregation and were distributed across France, England, Scotland and Wales. We will conclude by considering the architecture of the Tironensian order in an attempt to distinguish between the impact of the architecture of the motherhouse (“Tironensian architecture”) and the local architectural traditions of the geographic region(s) in which the dependent abbeys are located.

## **Tomasz Węclawowicz**

### *Four Romanesque Cistercian Abbey Churches in Lesser Poland*

This paper considers four Cistercian Abbeys at Jędrzejów, Koprzywnica, Wąchock and Sulejów, all of them built relatively quickly and at a broadly similar date. The monastic churches at each site share the same ground-plan, a well-established plan type traditionally associated with Cîteaux II. Their spatial organization is thus trans-regional and pan-European - fundamentally Cistercian. However, over the last fifty years there has been a continuing and lively discussion among Polish scholars as to the specific model behind their architectural form. Are the monastic churches Burgundian or Italian?

Regional specificity depends on ideological context - in which respect the Patrons Saints of these churches are important. These were chosen because they helped support the political aims of Krakow's duke or Krakow's bishop, or both. The Patrons thus honoured were St Adalbert (the first Patron Saint of the Polish Kingdom), St Florian (whose relics were brought from Italy to Krakow during the relevant period), and St Thomas Becket (whose cult was strongly promoted in the diocese of Krakow thanks to close contact between the local bishop and the English clergy).

There is another regional element in this as well. In Western Europe more generally, Cistercian monasteries were usually built in remote and inhospitable regions; so that the monks would not come into contact with laymen and could follow a life of strict religious discipline. In both Poland and Lesser Poland, Cistercian monasteries were always located by the seat of a local ruler and were initially given an older church or a chapel. Thanks to the initiatives of local bishops and lay founders, even such pan-European architectural forms (and ideas) as those promoted by the Cistercians thus acquired certain local and regional characteristics.

## **Béla Zsolt Szakács**

### *A country without regions? The case of Hungary*

Looking at a map of medieval Europe the Kingdom of Hungary is among the larger countries of Latin Christianity. Since the Middle Ages, geographers divided the kingdom into regions. While classifications vary, the most generally accepted geographic entities include Transdanubia (west of the river Danube), Upper Hungary (present-day Slovakia and North Hungary), Transylvania (now part of Romania) and the Great Hungarian Plain in the middle of the Carpathian Basin. The continental part of Croatia (Slavonia) also formed a part of Hungary. Dalmatia was ruled by Hungarian kings only briefly, and its artistic heritage is closer to Italy than to Central Europe. Although this regional division seems superficially useful, the monuments themselves do not necessarily follow this logic.

Artistic connections are best detected at a micro-regional level. A major monument of Late Romanesque in Western Hungary, the Abbey of Ják, is surrounded by a number of village churches that show the clear influence of the monastic workshop. Another example is the county of Spiš (Zips, Szepes), where village churches were built in a local Late Romanesque style (combined with Gothic decoration) after the middle of the 13th century. Elements of this style are present in other parts of East Hungary (Bihar, Bereg) as late as the early 14th century.

Regarding the major monuments, the links that bind different regions seem to be stronger. The cathedral of the Transylvanian Bishopric in Gyulafehérvár (Alba Julia) could be easily translocated to Transdanubia. On the level of monastic architecture, however, the result is different. Comparing the Abbey church of Lébény in Transdanubia to Boldva in East Hungary (both from ca. 1200), significant differences can be detected. At Lébény, the church is built of ashlar, it is vaulted, has two western towers, while the wall is highly articulated and richly decorated with Late Romanesque sculpture. The church of Boldva was built of brick, its aisles are tall but are covered with a timber roof, the towers are located at the east, while the walls are largely plain. While Boldva belongs to Upper Hungary, comparable monuments are to be found in the Great Plain (Ákos) and Transylvania (Harina). These differences are better understood in relation to the question of East and West, rather than in a regional framework.

Differences between the regions can be detected as early as in the 11th century. A typical local style using palmette decoration and *acanthus spinosa* capitals appears in the middle of the 11th century in Transdanubia and started to be used in the North (Bény, Feldebrő), East (Sárvármonostor) and South (Dombó). Regional differences are often combined with chronological discrepancies. If Transdanubia has special characteristics, this is partially due to its role of transmitting Western influences into the Hungarian Kingdom.

Thus, a traditional regional model does not seem to operate properly in the territory of medieval Hungary. This is related to the historical circumstances. Unlike in most European kingdoms, the various regions of Hungary did not work as partially autonomous units and did not have a thriving local aristocracy. Administration was centrally organised, and the nobility, who had estates in different parts of the country, moved freely between regions. The same is true for ecclesiastical organization: diocesan boundaries did not coincide with the geographical regions and prelates frequently moved between episcopal sees. This explains the strong interregional artistic connections within Hungary

## **James D’Emilio**

### *Romanesque Architecture and Sculpture in Galicia: A Regional Style?*

In modern Galicia, five cathedrals and five large-scale Cistercian monasteries preserve twelfth or early thirteenth-century buildings, while over eight hundred parish churches or minor monasteries retain parts of their Romanesque fabric, often including sculpture or ornament. The region’s geographic integrity and this combination of rural churches and major monuments make it a laboratory for assessing the concept of a regional Romanesque style. More than 95% of surviving churches had single cell naves with a semicircular apse or rectangular sanctuary. They share an architectural and sculptural vocabulary: the organization of doorways, windows, and chancel arches; the forms of decorative and foliate ornament; and the structure and profiles of capitals, bases, and arches. More complex sculpture is closely bound to the region’s cathedrals or well-defined local workshops. Some features certainly occur across northern Spain; some have more limited ranges within Galicia. Overall, however, their distinctive combination defines the regional style.

As an analytical tool, this description of a shared regional vocabulary is useful. Against that template, we can isolate unusual elements that invite explanation. Innovations, imported features, or variations of familiar patterns allow us to distinguish workshops, map their activity geographically and through buildings of different scale, and discern divisions of labour. Such features reveal the roles of patrons, chart the impact of key projects, or indicate the relative openness or isolation of districts within Galicia. Descriptively, the concept of a regional style provides a valid framework for analysing the making of Romanesque architecture and sculpture. It is not clear, however, that this translates—as modern advocates of regional movements might contend—into any kind of signification or regional identity. Within the region, one can define and map subgroups of buildings in which certain features—such as the cusped lintel or capital types—may have had expressive value to highlight, for example, close ties to an episcopal see or the tastes of aristocratic patrons, but the regional style itself resists such interpretations.

Where we do find meaning is in the self-consciously trans-regional style of the Cistercians and of Santiago cathedral. At the Cistercian abbeys, local craftsmen were subject to careful oversight in the use, placement, or exclusion of commonplace decoration—from billeting to foliage. Such supervision extended to more modest projects directed by craftsmen familiar with norms at the abbeys. At Compostela, the Pórtico da Gloria eclectically assembles architectural and sculptural forms, whose combination is unparalleled. This purposeful choice, consistent with the literature and ideology of the shrine and apostolic cult, anthologizes regional styles and presents pilgrims with a cosmopolitan vision that culminates and recapitulates their journey. By using regionally based formulas in this way, the Pórtico—like the Pilgrims’ Guide—demonstrates a twelfth-century awareness of regional difference and may, in turn, contribute to giving regional styles new meaning.

## **Benjamin Zweig**

### *Reassessing the Problem of Romanesque in Scandinavia*

The application of the term Romanesque to Scandinavian art and architecture of the eleventh and twelfth centuries presents a problematic narrative. Surveys exploring Romanesque architecture from a pan-European perspective, such as Eric Fernie’s 2014 book, often describe a unidirectional vector of influence determined by the activities of missionaries or from imperial states to the south. The literature from the Scandinavian countries has presented much the same story while further compounding the problem by writing its art history within the boundaries of contemporary national borders. The history of Romanesque art and architecture in Scandinavia has thus occupied an uneasy position between peripheral marginalization and rigid nationalism.

This paper offers a critique of the above approaches, and instead proposes an alternative way through which to consider the development of the Romanesque in Scandinavia. Rather than seeing the Romanesque as unilaterally introduced from the outside, this paper asks what happens when we understand it as being generated and adopted from the inside. It does so by linking the flowering and usage of Romanesque forms in Scandinavia with the broad networks of trade, political alliances, and nascent state formation established during the end of the Viking age – a period that overlaps with the rise of the style in mainland Europe. Building on the work of historian Anders Winroth, this paper gives pride of place to the role that internationally connected ecclesiastics, chieftains, and farmers might have played in the style’s adoption. This paper thus attempts to re-orient the discussion of the Romanesque in Scandinavia towards a different set of considerations that replace the center-periphery model. In

the end, I argue, such an approach better illuminates the development of the Romanesque at the most northern edge of medieval Europe and, in effect, presents us with a richer overall view of the style's geographic reach.

## **Cecily Hennessy**

### *Winchester's Holy Sepulchre Chapel and Byzantium: Iconographic Transregionalism?*

The regional style of painting in the 12th-century decoration of the Holy Sepulchre Chapel at Winchester Cathedral has been a well-versed topic since the paintings were found in 1963. On the east wall the paintings depict in two registers the Deposition and the Entombment/Lamentation. While details of the latter are disputed, this paper will suggest that it portrays Christ laid out in death on what appears to be a red stone. Christ is not being placed into the sarcophagus, which is some distance below, but rests on the stone, while his body is anointed for burial and the Virgin and companions lament over his death. Comparisons with other English painting, such as Christ's entombment in the *St. Albans Psalter* (p. 48), and in the *Winchester Psalter* (fol. 23r), where he appears to be being placed in the sarcophagus, show the distinction of the Holy Sepulchre Chapel paintings.

It is widely recognised that Byzantine iconography is present in the Holy Sepulchre Chapel paintings. It may also be possible to tie features of the representation to specific events in Constantinople. In Byzantium, an iconography of the Lamentation developed out of that of the Entombment in the 11th and 12th centuries. The Lamentation was then further affected by the translation of the stone on which Christ was embalmed, known as the *lithos*, to Constantinople. It was brought from Ephesus by Emperor Manuel I (1143-80) in 1169-70. Manuel purportedly carried it on his shoulders from the Boukoleon Harbour to the Chapel of our Lady of the Pharos, which housed famous relics of the Passion. Ten years later it was moved to the Komnenian mausoleum at the Pantokrator monastery and Manuel was buried beside it. It was described by a contemporary historian as 'a red stone, long as a human body'. Following this the red stone is shown in Lamentation scenes, with Christ laying on it.

This paper will develop the new proposal that a significant imperial and religious event that took place in Constantinople, having influenced Byzantine iconography, was incorporated into the paintings in the Winchester chapel. This leads to the question of the identity of the patron associated with this swift movement of iconographic influence, and to what extent this iconographic change may be due to religious, political or cultural initiatives.

## **Kristen Collins**

### *Regional and Transregional in Museum Displays of Romanesque Art*

Teaching and presenting Romanesque in the context of a museum exhibition is a perennially challenging prospect, placing a category of art that eludes tidy periodization and consistent stylistic descriptors into a streamlined pedagogical setting. Museums, for the most part, have skirted the problems of a monolithic Romanesque by presenting exhibitions organized geographically. In the past thirty-five years major shows on the topic have included the Hayward Gallery's *English Romanesque Art: 1066-1200* (1984), the Louvre's *La France Romane* (2005), and Paderborn's *Canossa 1077: Erschütterung der Welt* (2006). While the 1961 Council of Europe exhibition of Romanesque art mounted in Barcelona and Santiago de Compostela brought together art from several major European centres, it nonetheless presented works in separate rooms, grouped by region.

Such display strategies run counter to current scholarly interests in the global Middle Ages, focusing on Mediterranean and Baltic networks of exchange, portability, and transcultural objects. While the Metropolitan Art Museum has presented several important exhibitions that successfully presented the global span of Byzantium, there has not yet been a major exhibition that takes a similarly transregional approach to western art of the eleventh and twelfth centuries. This paper will offer a brief historiography of museum displays of the Romanesque and discuss strategies for and limitations to modifying the way this material is presented. Questions to be addressed are: Is the Romanesque a category whose time has passed and if so what are the new rubrics we might use to teach this material? In the age of thematic exhibitions, do we place too much emphasis on commonalities over cultural and aesthetic difference when adopting a transregional approach? And ultimately, does the term Romanesque advance or hinder an understanding of art of *circa* 1000 to 1250?

This paper draws from research conducted as part of a larger project with Gerhard Lutz, curator at the Dommuseum Hildesheim.